

Review of Revisions to “Atmospheric River Representation in the Energy Exascale Earth System Model (E3SM) Version 1.0” by Kim et al.

General Comments:

I appreciate the author’s consideration of my major concerns as well as my additional suggestions. I feel that the authors have sufficiently bolstered the methodology section, including their description of the E3SM model and the Guan and Waliser AR detection algorithm. The authors have also addressed the concerns of both reviewers related to the use of absolute vs. relative differences in comparing E3SM to MERRA2. The authors now place the differences into proper context and, in doing so, give the reader a much more realistic perspective on the biases in E3SM. Finally, though finding pathways toward improving these biases in E3SM is important, I acknowledge that proposing and evaluating specific model improvements is beyond the scope of this study. However, I appreciate the authors’ reference to possible model improvements in the conclusion.

Overall, I have no additional major concerns and feel that this manuscript is now suitable for publication.