

## ***Interactive comment on “Using Radar Observations to Evaluate 3D Radar Echo Structure Simulated by a Global Model” by Jingyu Wang et al.***

**Astrid Kerkweg**

a.erkweg@fz-juelich.de

Received and published: 25 May 2020

Dear authors,

in my role as Executive editor of GMD, I would like to bring to your attention our Editorial version 1.2:

<https://www.geosci-model-dev.net/12/2215/2019/>

This highlights some requirements of papers published in GMD, which is also available on the GMD website in the ‘Manuscript Types’ section:

[http://www.geoscientific-model-development.net/submission/manuscript\\_types.html](http://www.geoscientific-model-development.net/submission/manuscript_types.html)

C1

In particular, please note that for your paper, the following requirements have not been met in the Discussions paper:

- “If the model development relates to a single model then the model name and the version number must be included in the title of the paper. If the main intention of an article is to make a general (i.e. model independent) statement about the usefulness of a new development, but the usefulness is shown with the help of one specific model, the model name and version number must be stated in the title. The title could have a form such as, “Title outlining amazing generic advance: a case study with Model XXX (version Y)”.”
- "Code must be published on a persistent public archive with a unique identifier for the exact model version described in the paper or uploaded to the supplement, unless this is impossible for reasons beyond the control of authors. All papers must include a section, at the end of the paper, entitled "Code availability". Here, either instructions for obtaining the code, or the reasons why the code is not available should be clearly stated. It is preferred for the code to be uploaded as a supplement or to be made available at a data repository with an associated DOI (digital object identifier) for the exact model version described in the paper. Alternatively, for established models, there may be an existing means of accessing the code through a particular system. In this case, there must exist a means of permanently accessing the precise model version described in the paper. In some cases, authors may prefer to put models on their own website, or to act as a point of contact for obtaining the code. Given the impermanence of websites and email addresses, this is not encouraged, and authors should consider improving the availability with a more permanent arrangement. Making code available through personal websites or via email contact to the authors is not sufficient. After the paper is accepted the model archive should be updated to include a link to the GMD paper."

C2

As the only model used in your study is the E3SM model, provide its name and version number in the title. (e.g., "by the global mode E3SM (V...)"

Additionally, note that Github is not a permanent repository. Thus ensure permanent archiving of the exact version used for this publication. (e.g., by upload on Zenodo).

Best regards, Astrid Kerkweg (Executive Editor)

---

Interactive comment on Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-2020-98>, 2020.