

Interactive comment on “Retrieval of process rate parameters in the general dynamic equation for aerosols using Bayesian state estimation” by Matthew Ozon et al.

Astrid Kerkweg

a.kerkweg@fz-juelich.de

Received and published: 14 November 2020

Dear authors,

in my role as Executive editor of GMD, I would like to bring to your attention our Editorial version 1.2:

<https://www.geosci-model-dev.net/12/2215/2019/>

This highlights some requirements of papers published in GMD, which is also available on the GMD website in the ‘Manuscript Types’ section:

http://www.geoscientific-model-development.net/submission/manuscript_types.html >

C1

In particular, please note that for your paper, the following requirements have not been met in the Discussions paper:

- The main paper must give the model name and version number (or other unique identifier) in the title.
- "Code must be published on a persistent public archive with a unique identifier for the exact model version described in the paper or uploaded to the supplement, unless this is impossible for reasons beyond the control of authors. All papers must include a section, at the end of the paper, entitled "Code availability". Here, either instructions for obtaining the code, or the reasons why the code is not available should be clearly stated. It is preferred for the code to be uploaded as a supplement or to be made available at a data repository with an associated DOI (digital object identifier) for the exact model version described in the paper. Alternatively, for established models, there may be an existing means of accessing the code through a particular system. In this case, there must exist a means of permanently accessing the precise model version described in the paper. In some cases, authors may prefer to put models on their own website, or to act as a point of contact for obtaining the code. Given the impermanence of websites and email addresses, this is not encouraged, and authors should consider improving the availability with a more permanent arrangement. Making code available through personal websites or via email contact to the authors is not sufficient. After the paper is accepted the model archive should be updated to include a link to the GMD paper."

Therefore, create a reference to your algorithm and its version in the title of your paper upon revision of the manuscript.

Regarding the code availability section, I want to emphasize, that it is not sufficient to make a proposition to make the code publicly available upon final publication. The code

C2

is part of the review process and thus should be already available for the discussion phase except license issue prevent this. But if you can make it available later on, this seems not to be the case here.

Yours,

Astrid Kerkweg

Interactive comment on Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-2020-236>, 2020.