

Interactive comment on “Spin-up Characteristics with Three Types of Initial Fields and the Restart Effects on the Forecast Accuracy in GRAPES Global Forecast System” by Zhanshan Ma et al.

David Ham

david.ham@imperial.ac.uk

Received and published: 28 August 2020

This is an executive editor comment highlighting the ways in which this manuscript is not currently compliant with GMD policy on code and data availability.

The issues here must be addressed before a revised manuscript can be accepted for publication:

1. No model source code. The code and data availability section merely states that code is not available due to "the confidentiality requirement". GMD does permit model code to be withheld from publication if this is unavoidable for reasons be-

- yond the control of the authors. Usually this is because the copyright licence of the code does not permit redistribution. However, the reasons that the authors cannot release the code must be detailed in the code and data availability section. In particular, it is important to state who can get a licence and how.
2. Version not identified. Neither the title of the manuscript nor the code and data availability section state precisely which version of GRAPES_GFS was used. This makes it impossible to reproduce the work even if one has a licence.
 3. Model data is not on a persistent public repository. The model data appears to be on a cloud storage provided by Baidu. This lacks the persistence, non-revocability and persistent identifiers required for a journal publication. The data should instead be stored in a properly persistent archive with a persistent identifier such as a DOI. I note in this regard that the authors are from national laboratories so I would expect such facilities to be available to them.
 4. No configuration, run, or data processing scripts. The configuration files, run scripts and any data processing or analysis scripts used to produce the results presented in the manuscript need to be publicly and persistently archived, and cited from the code and data availability section. As a guide, every file the user would need to reproduce the manuscript should be accessible.

Further details on code and data availability requirements are in the GMD model code and data policy: https://www.geoscientific-model-development.net/about/code_and_data_policy.html. The reasons for the policy and more detail are provided in this editorial: <https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-12-2215-2019>. In particular, these documents cover what information you need to provide if the model source code can not be released, and what the requirements of suitable data archives are.

Interactive comment on Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-2020-177>, 2020.