

Interactive comment on “BFM17 v1.0: Reduced-Order Biogeochemical Flux Model for Upper Ocean Biophysical Simulations” by Katherine M. Smith et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 2 September 2020

Referee Report on Manuscript

GMD-2020-134

“BFM17 v1.0: Reduced-Order Biogeochemical Flux Model for Upper Ocean Biophysical Simulations”

By

Katherine M. Smith et al.

This manuscript concerns the development of a biogeochemical model of open-ocean ecosystem dynamics called BFM17. The authors make the case that the model is

C1

“complex and flexible enough to capture open-ocean ecosystem dynamics, but reduced enough to incorporate into highly resolved numerical simulations with limited additional computational cost.”. Furthermore, they provide validation of the model in 0D and 1D mode with measured data from an oligotrophic open ocean station.

In general, I agree with the claims of the authors. My view is that reduced complexity models such as this one are important for process studies, so I welcome the initiative of the authors to develop one more option for biogeochemical modelers. It would be preferable to have a validation also in a 3d setting, which is the one that the model was developed for but, since the model equations use standard formulations for the source and sink terms, I believe that the validation presented in the manuscript is sufficient.

Overall, I think the model has the potential to become a valuable addition to the tools available to study ocean biogeochemistry processes. With models such as these, only time can tell if it will fulfill this promise. My only remark is that, like similar papers, little time is dedicated to describe the way the parameter values are found. I find it peculiar that since, as everybody in this business knows, model parameters are paramount to getting decent model results, hardly no one takes the time to explain how they got to the values they are using. Thus, I urge the authors to add a little more detail on this matter, because it will certainly help other that may want to use the BFM17 model in their work.

Please check the reference style in line 347.

Interactive comment on Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-2020-134>, 2020.

C2