Geoscientific
Model Development
Discussions

Open Access

EGU

# Interactive comment on "Atmospheric aging of small-scale wood combustion emissions (model MECHA 1.0) – is it possible to distinguish causal effects from non-causal associations?" *by* Ville Leinonen et al.

**David Ham**

david.ham@imperial.ac.uk

Received and published: 16 May 2020

This is an executive editor comment highlighting the ways in which this manuscript is not currently compliant with GMD policy on code and data availability.

In the case of this manuscript, the issues are exceptionally serious and need to be addressed immediately. To quote from the GMD model code and data policy: [1]

---

[1]https://www.geoscientific-model-development.net/about/code_and_data_policy.html

> Code and data access must be provided at the time that the discussion paper is submitted. Embargoes, whether pending acceptance or for a defined period, are not acceptable.

Here, the authors have completely ignored this rule by failing to provide any code at all, and only providing incomplete data. This undermines the open review process of GMD and needs to be remedied forthwith. Specifically, the full code and data must be publicly and persistently archived and cited from the code and data availability section. Given that these citations have been omitted from the manuscript, the authors need to rapidly post an author comment citing the code and data. If this is not possible the manuscript is not yet ready for peer review and should be rejected.

As an aside, I should point out that the code and data availability policy specifically states that GitHub is not a suitable archival site. Indeed, even GitHub tell users to use Zenodo for this purpose[2].

The authors should familiarise themselves with the code and data policy and need to ensure that the manuscript complies with it fully. Further explanation of the policy is contained in the connected editorial: https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-12-2215-2019.

---

Interactive comment on Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-2020-13, 2020.

---

[2]https://guides.github.com/activities/citable-code/