

<https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-2019-59>

Topical Editor Decision: Publish subject to minor revisions (review by editor) (26 Jul 2019) by Leena Järvi

Comments to the Author:

Dear Titta,

You have responded to the minor referee comments well but there are a few technical issues that still require your attention. You have added additional supplementary material S4_Ross_1981.pdf which includes copied pages from the book by Ross. In order to have this appendix, you should obtain written consent from the publisher Springer to re-use the material. I also noticed that in the reference list, the publisher for the book should be Springer. Junk Publishers is the Copyright holder. Please correct this.

Here some small issues I found from the manuscript:

P3, L24: Extra bracket after Pinty 2004, 2006. Same applies to P18, L14.

P3, L26: I would remove comma before and correctly

P18, L2: Should be data are

P18, L19: I think lost should not be included to the sentence

Table 3 text: Should read "Standard error is given inside parenthesis"

Authors response to the Topical Editor:

Dear Leena,

We thank the Topical Editor for the positive assessment of our revised manuscript. As the book by Ross (1981) is currently available online (<https://link.springer.com/book/10.1007/978-94-009-8647-3>), we decided to remove the 'S4_Ross_1981.pdf' from supplements and citations to S4 from the text.

- The publisher for the book by Ross was changed from Junk Publishers to Springer.
- Extra bracket removed from P3, L24 and P18, L14.
- The comma was removed (P3, L26).
- The 'is' was replaced with 'are' (P18, L2).
- P18, L19: We could not find this typo. However, if the typo refers to p18, L9-L11, that is a direct quotation from CLM5 manual.
- The Table 3 sentence was revised as suggested.