

Interactive comment on “Improving permafrost physics in the coupled Canadian Land Surface Scheme (v. 3.6.2) and Canadian Terrestrial Ecosystem Model (v. 2.1) (CLASS-CTEM)” by Joe R. Melton et al.

David Ham

david.ham@imperial.ac.uk

Received and published: 24 May 2019

I am writing as an executive editor of GMD to highlight an issue with the code availability section which needs to be remedied in the revised manuscript.

I appreciate the lengths to which you have gone to identify the exact versions of the code corresponding to the experiments in the manuscript. There remain two concerns.

C1

Code only on GitLab

The code reference is to a GitLab repository (in a personal account at that), and the individual tags are git tags. This doesn't provide the persistence required of the data in a journal paper. If the project moves to a different revision control system, or even just to GitHub then the links will go dead. For this reason, the code associated with each of your tags needs to be persistently archived. Many authors find Zenodo (<https://zenodo.org>) a good solution for this, it basically comes down to uploading a tarball and metadata (or you could push a copy of your repo to GitHub and use the automated GitHub-Zenodo integration). Note that you are still positively encouraged to provide a link to the preferred download location for your software (which might well be GitLab), but this should be in addition to citing persistent archives.

Insufficient documentation to reproduce

When I click through to your GitLab page, I can't find documentation which would tell me how to build the model and run the experiments in the paper. The readme file claims to contain links to documentation, but these are broken. A link to a wiki is also not very persistent: would a user coming to this after the project has ended be able to work out how to re-run the experiments in this manuscript?

Please ensure that both your code and documentation are preserved in persistent, public archives.

Interactive comment on Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-2019-42>, 2019.

C2