

## ***Interactive comment on “Extending the Modular Earth Submodel System (MESSy v2.55) model hierarchy: The ECHAM/MESSy idealized (EMIL) model set-up” by Hella Garny et al.***

**Astrid Kerkweg**

[a.kerkweg@fz-juelich.de](mailto:a.kerkweg@fz-juelich.de)

Received and published: 30 January 2020

Dear authors,

as a GMD executive editor checking the manuscript for compliance with the GMD rules and as a MESSy user and developer myself, I am really confused by the MESSy version number provided in the title.

The MESSy user and developer knows, (1) that MESSy v2.55 is not yet released (not even completely fixed at the time of publication of the discussion version of your article) and (2) that your developments will be part of the v2.55 release.

C1

So the code availability section is correct, but MESSy v2.55 could not have been used to produce results. Attentive reading of the title leads to the recognition, yes, the extension of the MESSy model hierarchy is available from MESSy v2.55 on.

Unfortunately, the title promotes the misconception, that the results of the article are produced with MESSy v2.55, what is not yet possible. The introduction of Section 2 further strengthens this wrong impression. Therefore the version number in the title and in the introduction of section2 needs to be "based on v2.54". While in the code availability section the additional important information is "available in MESSy v2.55" (as is already the case).

Note, that the exact code version(s), with which you produced the results shown in this article need(s) to be permanently archived.

Best regards, Astrid Kerkweg

---

Interactive comment on Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-2019-330>, 2019.

C2