Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss.,
https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-2019-318-RC2, 2020

Geoscientific Model Development Discussions
Open Access
EGU

Interactive comment on "The "ABC-DA system" (v1.4): a variational data assimilation system for convective scale assimilation research with a study of the impact of a balance constraint" *by* Ross Noel Bannister

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 3 May 2020

Review of the GMD submitted article referenced as:

Title: The "ABC-DA system" (v1.4): a variational data assimilation system for convective scale assimilation research with a study of the impact of a balance constraint Author(s): Ross Noel Bannister MS No.: gmd-2019-318 MS Type: Model description paper Iteration: Minor Revision

The paper presents a very comprehensive technical description of a toy data assimilation system based on the previously published ABC-model formulation and codes. Its

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

content is extremely detailed and can easily serve as useful introduction to any scientist, including young scientists and post-graduate students, interested in uploading and using the codes for research or education. The technical content is complemented by a showcase example of the scientific use of the system (the study of the impact of the ABC-associated geostrophic balance constraint in the B-matrix model).

The article is clearly written and the figures are of good quality. The presentation as a whole matches the expected goal which is to provide a scientific introduction to the ABC-DA system. As a reviewer of this article, I do not consider that my role is to evaluate or critizise whether the ABC-model and DA formulation will be a useful scientific tool per se. The present paper will however enable the scientific data assimilation community evaluate that usefulness in practice. I therefore recommend the paper for publication after very minor revisions.

Hereafter follow my minor comments:

1) about §4.1: from what platform can a user upload UM data for initializing the very first steps ? Or are such data available with the ABC system packages ?

Ensembles play an important role in many cases of the toy applications. Can you say a few words about how the size of the super-ensemble is set, and what would be a "reasonable" limit of size ?

2) About Fig 6b: this particular plot is actually little discussed in the core text. My question is, noting that the vertical lengthscale increases with increasing vertical mode (i.e. the more nodes on the vertical, the deeper the penetration scale of the mode), is this behaviour due to the fact that the plot holds for the unbalanced part of the scaled density ? i.e. one expects the opposite property for the balanced part of scaled density (low-order vertical modes of balanced scaled density would have the largest vertical lengthscales ?). Is this correct ? I suggest a short comment about Fig 6b could be added in §4.3 or §4.4.

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

3) about §4.7: it is stated that the ABC-DA system is flexible enough to host a variety of DA methods, like 4D-VAR or Ensemble-Variational formulations. It seems indeed clear from the article that methods based on variational formulations, including iterative steps such as a minimisation and the computation of a gradient, are allowed. However, what about methods like Extended or Ensemble Kalman filters, or versions of Optimal Interpolation, i.e. methods where the Gain Matrix (G) would be somehow explicitly computed, and a direct inversion step involving G would be implied ? Similarly, what about methods involving a number of computational steps in observation space as for LETKF (Local Ensemble Transform Kalman filters) ? Can the author elaborate in only a few lines on these algorithms, in order to provide an insider view about how easy/how difficult/how different the implementation of such methods in ABC-DA would be ?

4) §6, line 776: typo "... that that ..." => "... that the ..."

5) line 774-780: in the discussion of the "control-ability" of the v-component of the wind fields. Is this weak control-ability due to the specific formulation of the ABC toy model ? (my guess is "yes"). Can you comment this more in the discussion ?

6) §4.2-4.3-4.4 & §5: One general question I have is whether the ABC-DA system can allow the use of a full, total field, B-matrix (that is, one without any balance modeling) ? If a total-field B-matrix would be feasible, then the corresponding ABC-DA system could be a valuable reference system for impact studies on specific B-modeling. Can you comment on this ?

Interactive comment on Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-2019-318, 2020.

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper