

Interactive comment on “The effect of satellite derived leaf area index and roughness length information on modelled reactive nitrogen deposition in north-western Europe” by Shelley C. van der Graaf et al.

Astrid Kerkweg

a.kerkweg@fz-juelich.de

Received and published: 7 November 2019

Dear authors,

in my role as Executive editor of GMD, I would like to bring to your attention our Editorial version 1.2:

<https://www.geosci-model-dev.net/12/2215/2019/>

This highlights some requirements of papers published in GMD, which is also available

C1

on the GMD website in the ‘Manuscript Types’ section:

http://www.geoscientific-model-development.net/submission/manuscript_types.html

In particular, please note that your paper is not of the type "Model experiment description paper" but it belongs in the category "Development and technical papers". As such it has to meet the following requirements:

- “If the model development relates to a single model then the model name and the version number must be included in the title of the paper. If the main intention of an article is to make a general (i.e. model independent) statement about the usefulness of a new development, but the usefulness is shown with the help of one specific model, the model name and version number must be stated in the title. The title could have a form such as, “Title outlining amazing generic advance: a case study with Model XXX (version Y)”.”
- Code must be published on a persistent public archive with a unique identifier for the exact model version described in the paper or uploaded to the supplement, unless this is impossible for reasons beyond the control of authors. All papers must include a section, at the end of the paper, entitled "Code availability". Here, either instructions for obtaining the code, or the reasons why the code is not available should be clearly stated. It is preferred for the code to be uploaded as a supplement or to be made available at a data repository with an associated DOI (digital object identifier) for the exact model version described in the paper. Alternatively, for established models, there may be an existing means of accessing the code through a particular system. In this case, there must exist a means of permanently accessing the precise model version described in the paper. In some cases, authors may prefer to put models on their own website, or to act as a point of contact for obtaining the code. Given the impermanence of websites and email addresses, this is not encouraged, and authors should consider improving the availability with a more permanent arrangement. Making code available

C2

through personal websites or via email contact to the authors is not sufficient. After the paper is accepted the model archive should be updated to include a link to the GMD paper.

Thus the title of your manuscript needs to include the model name and its version number. Additionally please ensure, that the exact model version you are using will be permanently available. Third, please note that the model code is not sufficient. As the most vital part of your analyses deals with the MODIS input data, the reader should be able to access these as well. Therefore please make the respective data sets available (or state which license issues need to be fulfilled to get access).

Yours,

Astrid Kerkweg

Interactive comment on Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-2019-256>, 2019.