

Interactive comment on “Gridded Emissions for CMIP6” by Leyang Feng et al.

Jason Williams (Editor)

williams@knmi.nl

Received and published: 26 November 2019

Dear Authors,

Before the manuscript can be accepted in its final form can you address the following issues:

(i) Missing software name and version identifier. Software is provided for generating the data sets. This software needs to be named and versioned, and the name and version included in the paper title. This is important as the methods and software presented may change in the future and it is important that others are able to clearly identify the version that this manuscript describes. (ii) Github URLs. Github is an excellent development platform, but it lacks the features required of an archive. GitHub themselves tell authors to use Zenodo for this purpose. The authors should follow the procedure detailed here to archive the exact version of the software used to create the results

C1

presented: <https://guides.github.com/activities/citable-code/>. The resulting Zenodo repositories present the correct bibliography entries to use. (iii) A website is cited for historical burning emissions, this is insufficiently persistent. Instead (or as well), the corresponding paper should be cited. I believe it is: <https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-10-3329-2017>. (iv) The reference to the CMIP6 data from the code and data section is too generic to be at all useful. This is only a technical issue, though, because it appears that the exact identifiers are in table 4. Table 4 should be referenced from the code and data availability section (this may seem petty, but readers of GMD papers know to go to this section to find the data). (v) In table 4 itself filenames are given to identify data on ESGF. This is unsafe. The ESGF records themselves provide the correct DOIs to cite, and if the authors click through those DOIs they get the full citation and even corresponding BibTeX and RIS files. The filenames should be replaced with proper data citations.

Thank you for your attention towards these issues.

Jason Williams.

Interactive comment on Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-2019-195>, 2019.