

Interactive comment on “Development and testing of scenarios for implementing Holocene LULC in Earth System Model Experiments” by Sandy P. Harrison et al.

David Ham

david.ham@imperial.ac.uk

Received and published: 25 October 2019

Thank you for your submission to GMD. Currently the data availability section of the paper does not appear to be compliant with GMD policy. The manuscript needs to be fully compliant before a revised manuscript can be accepted for publication in GMD.

The issues are as follows:

1. "climate model forcing data sets, their references, and their code will be provided on the PMIP4 website". GMD does not allow embargoed data. The data should all have been publicly archived before the manuscript was submitted. It must

C1

certainly be publicly archived before a revised manuscript could be accepted for publication in GMD.

2. The PMIP4 website does not appear to comply with the standards required for archiving of data presented in GMD papers. Project websites are not usually acceptable archive locations as they lack the persistence, non-revocability, and persistent identifiers required. Please see the GMD code and data policy. If the PMIP4 website does satisfy those requirements, then evidence for this needs to be presented, and the data should be referenced by persistent identifier (e.g. DOI) rather than URL. Otherwise, the data needs to be archived on a suitable location, such as Pangaea.
3. The reference to Pangaea is confusing. I think you are saying that the outputs of the experiments resulting from this MIP must be archived to Pangaea. That is completely reasonable, but then that should form part of the protocol. This section of the manuscript is for documenting where the data that this paper depends on can be found. In this case, this is the input data for the models.

For further details on GMD code and data archiving requirements, please see the recent editorial

Interactive comment on Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-2019-125>, 2019.