Geoscientific
Model Development
Discussions

Interactive comment on "Assimilation of SCATSAR Soil Wetness Index in SURFEX 8.0 to improve weather forecasts" *by* Stefan Schneider and Bernhard Bauer-Marschallinger

Jeffrey Neal (Editor)

j.neal@bristol.ac.uk

Received and published: 26 April 2019

Dear Stefan,

Thank you for your response to the reviewer's comments. Please accept my apologies for taking a few days to review your response over the Easter break.

Having reviewed the comments and your response to the reviewers I'm in agreement with Reviewer 2 that the paper has potential, however the presentation of the research is a long way from the required standard and will therefore need to be treated as if a new submission if a revised version is submitted. This is partly because of the exten-

sive nature of the revisions required, but also due to the need for additional analysis to address some of the reviewer's questions, which appears to be ongoing. If a significantly improved revised manuscript is submitted, I will be seeking additional referees for further review in addition to those who have commented already.

Further to the reviewer's comments, as a non-expert I find the second half of the introduction difficult to follow and overly focused on a set of technical changes without really explaining the motivation or outcome of these developments. Furthermore, the end of the introduction doesn't explain the motivation or aims of the paper in a clear way as these are distributed in the text between the introduction and chapter 2. The structure of the introduction therefore needs major revision.

The version number in the title is indeed a requirement of the journal as you state. I would agree with reviewer 2 that the maps in Figure 1 should include a scale and north arrow.

The expert reviewers have provided excellent feedback and the latter technical sections of the paper and I encourage you to address all reviewer comments

Best wishes, Jeff