Geoscientific
Model Development
Discussions

Interactive comment on "Validation of lake surface state in the HIRLAM NWP model against in-situ measurements in Finland" *by* Laura Rontu et al.

Jason Williams (Editor)

williams@knmi.nl

Received and published: 21 February 2019

Dear Authors,

I have read through the referees reports and your responses and would like to draw your attention to an instruction in the requirements for referees and editors, namely:

" If an editor is presented with convincing evidence that the main substance or conclusions of a paper published in an editor's journal are erroneous, the editor should facilitate publication of an appropriate paper pointing out the error and, if possible, correcting it."

I am especially concerned about the general conclusions of referee 2 where he/she states: Due to this bug the model data related to ice behaviour and spring LSWT tem-

perature became unrealistic and therefore the corresponding results and discussions are of very limited interest.

As a journal we aim for papers of the highest quality therefore must apply some rigorous measures to protect the reputation of the journal. As it stands, the model data used for this paper has a significant drawback in that an error exists which directly affects the parameters under investigation. This significantly weakens any conclusions that can be taken away, resulting in a study which is not robust. For this reason the paper cannot be published in it's current form.

I would like to suggest two possible solutions as Topical Editor: (i) Use data from previous studies which can be directly linked e.g. Kheyrollah Pour et al. (2014) and/or Eerola et al. (2014).

(ii) You mention in your response that new results will be available in spring of this year. I suggest you use these simulations without the bug in the flake model and perform the validation exercise on this most recent model version to address the most major concern of the referees.

your sincerely,

Jason Williams.

Interactive comment on Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-2018-270, 2018.