

Interactive comment on “Climate pattern scaling set for an ensemble of 22 GCMs – adding uncertainty to the IMOGEN impacts system” by Przemyslaw Zelazowski et al.

Przemyslaw Zelazowski et al.

chg@ceh.ac.uk

Received and published: 1 February 2017

Please note that some internal numbering from the review has changed slightly as review comments have been incorporated.

Comment 1.1. Dear authors, in my role as Executive editor of GMD, I would like to bring to your attention our Editorial version 1.1: <http://www.geosci-model-dev.net/8/3487/2015/gmd-8-3487-2015.html>. This highlights some requirements of papers published in GMD, which is also available on the GMD website in the ‘Manuscript Types’ section: http://www.geoscientific-model-development.net/submission/manuscript_types.html

C1

Response 1.1. Thank you for this and other comments. We have familiarised ourselves with the Editorial.

C.1.2. In particular, please note that for your paper, the following requirements have not been met in the Discussions paper: The main paper must give the model name and version number (or other unique identifier) in the title.

R.1.2. We have added the version number, and as IMOGEN vn 2.0. This makes a clear distinction from vn 1.0, which was only calibrated against the United Kingdom Met Office model, HadCM3. This distinction is also noted in the main body of the text.

C.1.3. If the model development relates to a single model then the model name and the version number must be included in the title of the paper. If the main intention of an article is to make a general (i.e. model independent) statement about the usefulness of a new development, but the usefulness is shown with the help of one specific model, the model name and version number must be stated in the title. The title could have a form such as, “Title outlining amazing generic advance: a case study with Model XXX (version Y)”.

R.1.3. Please see response to request above. IMOGEN v2.0 corresponds to the new calibration against a set of 22 GCMs. This paper is presenting a new model version.

C.1.4. All papers must include a section, at the end of the paper, entitled ‘Code availability’. Here, either instructions for obtaining the code, or the reasons why the code is not available should be clearly stated. It is preferred for the code to be uploaded as a supplement or to be made available at a data repository with an associated DOI (digital object identifier) for the exact model version described in the paper. Alternatively, for established models, there may be an existing means of accessing the code through a particular system. In this case, there must exist a means of permanently accessing the precise model version described in the paper. In some cases, authors may prefer to put models on their own website, or to act as a point of contact for obtaining the code. Given the impermanence of websites and email addresses, this is not encour-

C2

aged, and authors should consider improving the availability with a more permanent arrangement. After the paper is accepted the model archive should be updated to include a link to the GMD paper.

R.1.4. The main basis for the paper is the new driving dataset – the patterns and EBM parameters forcing the IMOGEN model, rather than the model itself. However, these developments in available drivers are sufficiently large as to constitute a new model version - here named v2.0. The original model is written out in full in existing papers, including an earlier Huntingford et al 2010 GMD paper. Unfortunately our original paper version had the link to our archived model drivers named “Data Availability”. This is now renamed “Data and Code Availability”.

The driving dataset described in this paper was placed on a permanent and well-recognised international archive EIDC, and is now linked appropriately from the manuscript. In addition, we now also cite the 2010 GMD paper regarding the model description, and add: “For current IMOGEN code, please contact the corresponding author” (page 12, from line 26).

C.1.5. If I understood your article correctly, the main model you developed is IMOGEN, therefore a version number of IMOGEN should be given in the title and a code availability section should inform the reader about if and how to gain access to IMOGEN.

R.1.5. Agreed; and implemented as explained above, including within the title “IMOGEN vn2.0”.

Interactive comment on Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., doi:10.5194/gmd-2016-221, 2016.