

***Interactive comment on “DebrisInterMixing-2.3:
a Finite Volume solver for three dimensional
debris flow simulations based on a single
calibration parameter – Part 2: Model validation”
by A. von Boetticher et al.***

J. Neal (Editor)

j.neal@bristol.ac.uk

Received and published: 2 December 2016

Dear Albrecht von Boetticher,

My final decision on this paper (gmd-2015-138) is that it should be rejected with an invitation to resubmit at the earliest convenience. In my opinion the work forms an important companion to the model description now published in gmd-2015-137 and would fit within the journal remit. However, the revisions made to the companion paper gmd-2015-137 since submission and the reviewer recommendation to change test

C4433

case mean that a revised version of gmd-2015-138 will be a substantially different manuscript to the original submission. A new set of reviews would be necessary because many of the reviewer comments from the original submission will not be relevant to the revised version.

A resubmission would allow us to conduct a new discussion with reference to the revised and published version of gmd-2015-137 rather than the original numerical description and would also avoid confusion between issues raised regarding the gmd-2015-138 test case and the scientific merit of the new submission. I believe this approach will yield a far clearer discussion process than a continuation of the previous discussion, which would essentially relate to two manuscripts.

Best wishes,

Jeff Neal

Interactive comment on Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., 8, 6379, 2015.