Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., 8, C1082–C1083, 2015
www.geosci-model-dev-discuss.net/8/C1082/2015/

Geoscientific Model Development Discussions
Open Access

Interactive comment on "The GRENE-TEA Model Intercomparison Project (GTMIP): overview and experiment protocol for Stage 1" *by* S. Miyazaki et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 14 June 2015

General comment:

This paper suffers from a confusive presentation. What do the authors want to present? A protocol or results?

In the abstract it sais this paper presents an experiment protocol, but alo preliminary results are mentioned. The main body of the paper focusses on the experiments (setup, datasets, plan, output) and on the pre-liminary results, which gives the reader the impression that the main focus is not the protocol, but the experimentation results. This impression is additionaly by the authors phrasing. For example, page 6, line 20: this paper focusses on stage 1 of the project, which evaluates the TPMs.... etc.". Another

Full Screen / Esc
Printer-friendly Version
Interactive Discussion
Discussion Paper

example are the scientific questions at page 7, lines 10-14. Lines 13-14 are specificially important, because that is what is exactly lacking in the paper (which processes are responsible for model performance), if the focus is on results rather then on protocol. A last example is the language used: page 10, line 25 "we will examine", page 11, line 8 "we will conduct". This is the kind of phrasing which is being used in a result-oriented paper.

However, as a result-oriented paper this manuscript is insufficient because all results are preliminary, and the results are not discussed.

Based on this I would reject the paper.

The summary (4) is however quite clear, this paper wants to present a protocol, and the preliminary results are an example.

My advice is to rewrite the paper, and make the audience more clear what your intentions are, right from the start of the manuscript.

Techical comments: page (p.) 3, line (l.) 4: replace one of the "system" by another word p3., l5.: planned and conducted at the same ? p3, l9: replace "due to"by "using" p3. l20: delete "the" p4, l10: delete "some" p4, l20: replace "This" by "The same" p4, l27: add a reference p6, l13: replace "This"by "a" p9, l6: "aims"

Caption Figure 3: "are shown by boxes"

Interactive comment on Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., 8, 3443, 2015.

GMDD

8, C1082–C1083, 2015