

Interactive comment on “Taking off the training wheels: the properties of a dynamic vegetation model without climate envelopes” by R. A. Fisher et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 10 June 2015

I find this paper to be clearly written, well argued, and a welcome contribution to the literature. The authors have done an excellent job summarizing the past literature on the topic, and have thus created a concise and consistent description of the field that is extremely readable. Similarly the appendix (technical note) is very clear and readable. I am eager to share their work with colleagues and students.

I have only two minor comments, and a few very minor comments.

Minor comments

pg 3310 ln 10 - This seems like a training wheel. You acknowledge this below (pg 3321 ln 16-17, "it is subject to a similar circularity of logic as the original climate envelope

C1062

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



approach"), but I think it is worth discussing here as well. Otherwise the reader is left wondering how this is different from a training wheel until much later in the paper.

Figure4 4-12 - Please (please!) consider choosing a different colormap for your images. The jet (or rainbow) colorbar is difficult to see for people who are colorblind and has some changes in hue which draw attention to features unnecessarily. I would strongly prefer a different set of colors.

Very minor comments

pg 3304 ln 17 typo?: "proscribe"

pg 3323 ln 6-10 I don't understand this sentence.

pg 3325 ln 16-23 Optimal parameter estimation has been done for limited regions for the ED model - i.e. Medvigy et al. 2009 It seems worth mentioning this here

Figure 3 - consider swapping the yellow and green colors. Yellow is generally harder to see, and there are only very few green points on the plot

Tech note: The placement of the footnote markers at the beginning of the paragraph is a bit odd. It took me a while to figure out what those were.

References

D. Medvigy, S. C. Wofsy, J. W. Munger, D. Y. Hollinger, and P. R. Moorcroft. Mechanistic scaling of ecosystem function and dynamics in space and time: Ecosystem demography model version 2. *Journal of Geophysical Research-Biogeosciences*, 114, Jan. 2009.

Interactive comment on Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., 8, 3293, 2015.

[Full Screen / Esc](#)[Printer-friendly Version](#)[Interactive Discussion](#)[Discussion Paper](#)