- 1 A simple object-oriented and open source model for scientific and policy analyses of
- 2 the global climate system–Hector v1.0
- 3 C.A. Hartin*, P. Patel, A. Schwarber, R.P. Link, and B.P. Bond-Lamberty
- 4
- 5 Pacific Northwest National Laboratory, Joint Global Change Research Institute at the
- 6 University of Maryland–College Park, 5825 University Research Court, College Park, MD
- 7 20740, USA
- 8
- 9 *Corresponding author: <u>corinne.hartin@pnnl.gov</u>
- 10
- 11

12 Abstract

13 Simple climate models play an integral role in the policy and scientific communities. 14 They are used for climate mitigation scenarios within integrated assessment models, 15 complex climate model emulation, and uncertainty analyses. Here we describe Hector 16 v1.0, an open source, object-oriented, simple global climate carbon-cycle model. This 17 model runs essentially instantaneously while still representing the most critical global 18 scale earth system processes. Hector has a three-part main carbon cycle: a one-pool 19 atmosphere, land, and ocean. The model's terrestrial carbon cycle includes primary 20 production and respiration fluxes, accommodating arbitrary geographic divisions into, 21 e.g., ecological biomes or political units. Hector actively solves the inorganic carbon 22 system in the surface ocean, directly calculating air-sea fluxes of carbon and ocean pH. 23 Hector reproduces the global historical trends of atmospheric $[CO_2]$, radiative forcing, 24 and surface temperatures. The model simulates all four Representative Concentration 25 Pathways with equivalent rates of change of key variables over time compared to 26 current observations, MAGICC (a well-known simple climate model), and models from 27 the 5th Coupled Model Intercomparison Project. Hector's flexibility, open source nature, 28 and modular design will facilitate a broad range of research in various areas. 29

30

31 **1.0 Introduction**

32 Projecting future impacts of anthropogenic perturbations on the climate system 33 relies on understanding the interactions of key earth system processes. To accomplish 34 this, a hierarchy of climate models with differing levels of complexity and resolution are 35 used, ranging from purely statistical or empirical models, to simple energy balance 36 models, to fully-coupled Earth System Models (ESMs) (Stocker, 2011). 37 Reduced-complexity or simple climate models (SCMs) lie in the middle of this 38 spectrum, representing only the most critical global scale earth system processes with 39 low spatial and temporal resolution, e.g., carbon fluxes between the ocean and 40 atmosphere, primary production and respiration fluxes on land. These models are 41 relatively easy to use and understand, and are computationally inexpensive. Most SCMs 42 have a few key features: 1) calculating future concentrations of greenhouse gases 43 (GHGs) from given emissions while modeling the global carbon cycle; 2) calculating 44 global mean radiative forcing from greenhouse gas concentrations; and 3) converting 45 the radiative forcing to global mean temperature (e.g., Wigley, 1991; Meinshausen et al., 46 2011a; Tanaka et al., 2007b; Lenton, 2000). 47 With these capabilities, SCMs play an integral role in decision making and scientific 48 research. For example, energy-economic-climate models or Integrated Assessment 49 Models (IAMs) are used to address issues on energy system planning, climate mitigation, 50 stabilization pathways, and land-use changes (Wigley et al., 1996; Edmonds and Smith,

51 2006; van Vuuren et al., 2011). ESMs are too computationally expensive to use in these

DRAFT

analyses. Therefore, all IAMs rely on a simple representation of the global climatesystem.

54 Depending on the purpose of the IAMs (economics, cost-benefit analysis, or more 55 physical based processes), the corresponding climate and carbon component varies in 56 complexity and resolution. For example, models like DICE, FUND, and MERGE have a 57 highly simplified carbon/climate system (Nordhaus, 2008; Anthoff and Tol, 2014; Manne 58 and Richels, 2005). IAMs focusing more on the physical processes of the natural system 59 and the economy employ more complex representations of the climate/carbon system. 60 Models like GCAM (Global Change Assessment Model) and MESSAGE use MAGICC as 61 their SCM (Meinshausen et al., 2011a; Riahi et al., 2007; Calvin et al., 2011). Increasing 62 in complexity, some IAMs include the climate/carbon system at gridded scales (e.g., 63 IMAGE), and can be coupled to earth system models of intermediate complexity (e.g., 64 MIT IGSM), or more recently coupled to a full earth system model (the iESM project) (Bouwman et al., 2006; Sokolov et al., 2005; Bond-Lamberty et al., 2014; Di Vittorio et 65 66 al., 2014; Collins et al., 2015).

57 SCMs such as MAGICC, GENIE, and the climate emulation tool at RDCEP are also 58 used as emulators of more complex ESMs (Meinshausen et al., 2011c; Schlesinger and 59 Jiang, 1990; Challenor, 2012; Ratto et al., 2012; Lenton et al., 2009; Castruccio et al., 50 2014). The behavior of SCMs can be constrained to replicate the overall behavior of the 51 more complex ESM. For instance, the climate sensitivity of a SCM can be made equal to 52 that of an ESM by altering a single model parameter. In particular, the MAGICC model 53 has been central to the analyses presented in the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate

DRAFT

Change (IPCC) reports, and can be parameterized to emulate a large suite of ESMs
(Meinshausen et al., 2011a).

76 Lastly, SCMs are computationally efficient and inexpensive to run. Therefore, they 77 are used to run multiple simulations of future climate change emissions scenarios, 78 parameter sensitivity experiments, perturbed physics experiments, large ensemble runs, 79 and uncertainty analyses (Senior and Mitchell, 2000; Hoffert et al., 1980; Harvey and 80 Schneider, 1985; Ricciuto et al., 2008; Sriver et al., 2012; Irvine et al., 2012). MAGICC, 81 the Bern CC model, and SNEASY are examples of a few models used for uncertainly 82 analysis (Meinshausen et al., 2011c; Urban and Keller, 2010; Joos et al., 2001b). SCMs 83 have been useful in reducing uncertainties in future CO₂ sinks, quantifying parametric 84 uncertainties in sea-level rise, ice-sheet modeling, ocean-heat uptake, and aerosol 85 forcing (Ricciuto et al., 2008; Sriver et al., 2012; Applegate et al., 2012; Urban and Keller, 86 2009).

87 This study introduces Hector v1.0, an open source, object-oriented, simple climate 88 carbon-cycle model. Hector was developed with three main goals in mind. First, Hector 89 is an open source model, an important quality given that the scientific community, 90 funding agencies, and journals are increasingly emphasizing transparency and open 91 source (E.P. White, 2013; Heron et al., 2013), particularly in climate change sciences 92 (Wolkovich et al., 2012). A large community of scientists can access, use, and enhance 93 open source models, with the potential for long-term utilization, improvement, and 94 reproducibility (Ince et al., 2012). Second, a clean design using an object-oriented 95 framework is critical for Hector development and future use. This allows for new

DRAFT

96	components to easily be added to Hector, i.e. the model's functionality to be easily		
97	extended in the future. In addition, this framework allows for easy coupling into IAMs,		
98	in particular GCAM. Lastly, Hector is a stand-alone simple climate model used to answer		
99	fundamental scientific research questions, uncertainty analysis, parameter sensitivities,		
100	etc.		
101	One of the fundamental questions faced in developing a SCM is how much detail		
102	should be represented in the climate system. Our goal is to introduce complexity only		
103	where warranted, keeping the representations of the climate system as simple as		
104	possible. This results in fewer calculations, faster execution times, and easier analysis		
105	and interpretation of results. Sections 2, 3, and 4 describe the structure and		
106	components of Hector. Sections 5 and 6 describe the experiments, results and		
107	comparison of Hector against observational data and other models (MAGICC and		
108	CMIP5).		
109			

110 **2.0 Model architecture**

111 **2.1 Overall structure and design**

Hector is written in C++ and uses an object-oriented design that enforces clean separation between its different parts, which interact via strictly defined interfaces. The separation keeps each software module self-contained, which makes the code easy for users to understand, maintain, and enhance. Entities in the model include a commandline *wrapper*, the model *coupler*, various *components* organized around scientific areas

DRAFT

(carbon cycling, radiative forcing, etc.) and *visitors* responsible for model output. Each ofthese is discussed below.

2.2 Model Coupler

120 Hector's control flow starts with the coupler, which is responsible for: 1) parsing 121 and routing input data to the model components; 2) tracking how the components 122 depend on each other; 3) passing messages and data between components; 4) providing 123 facilities for logging, time series interpolation, etc.; and 5) controlling the main model 124 loop as it progresses through time. Any errors thrown by the model are caught by the 125 wrapper, which prints a detailed summary of the error. 126 Input data are specified in flat text files, and during startup are routed to the 127 correct model component for its initialization. Some of the key initial model conditions 128 are summarized in Table 1 and Table 2. For more details of initial model conditions we 129 urge the reader to download Hector v1.0 (https://github.com/JGCRI/hector). 130 Components can send messages to each other during the model run, most often 131 requesting data. The messaging interface is also available to external subroutines, such as components of IAMs or other linked models. The coupler handles message routing 132 133 (via the *capability* mechanism, below) and enforces mandatory type checking: e.g., if a 134 component requests mean global temperature in °C but the data are provided in K, an 135 error will be thrown (i.e., execution halts) unless the receiving component can handle 136 this situation.

137 Visitor patterns are units of code that traverse all model components and handle
138 model output (Martin et al., 1997). Two visitors currently exist: one saves an easily-

DRAFT

119

readable summary table to an output file, while the other writes a stream of model data
(both standard outputs and internal diagnostics). After the model finishes, this 'stream'
file can be parsed and summarized by R scripts (R Development Core Team, 2014)
included with Hector. Log files may also be written by any model entity, using facilities
provided by the coupler. The full sequence of events during a model run is summarized
in Figure 1.

145

2.3 Components

146 Model components are submodels that communicate with the coupler. From 147 the coupler's point of view, components are fully defined by their capabilities and 148 dependencies. At model startup, before the run begins, components inform the coupler 149 of their capabilities, i.e., what data they can provide to or accept from the larger model 150 system. The coupler uses this information to route messages, such as requests for data, 151 between components. Components also register their dependencies, i.e., what results 152 they require from other components in order to complete their computations. After 153 initialization, but before the model begins to run, the coupler uses this dependency 154 information to determine the order in which components will be called in the main 155 control loop. 156 The model's modular architecture, and the *capability/dependency* systems 157 described above, allows swapping, enabling and disabling of model components directly

158 via the input without recompiling. For example, this means that a user can test two

different ocean submodels and easily compare results without having to rebuild themodel.

DRAFT

161

2.4 Time step, spinup, and constraints

162 The model's fundamental time step is 1 year, although the carbon cycle can 163 operate on a finer resolution when necessary (Section 3.1). When the model is on an 164 integer date (e.g. 1997.0) it is considered to be the midpoint of that particular calendar 165 year, in accordance with Representative Concentration Pathway (RCP) data 166 (Meinshausen et al., 2011b).

167 Like many models, Hector has an optional 'spinup' step, in which the model runs 168 to equilibrium in an a historical, perturbation-free mode (Pietsch and Hasenauer, 2006). 169 This occurs after model initialization, but before the historical run begins, and ensures 170 that the model is in steady state when it enters the main simulation. During spinup, the 171 coupler repeatedly calls all the model components in their dependency-driven ordering, 172 using an annual time step. Each component signals whether it needs further steps to 173 stabilize, and this process repeats until all components signal that they are complete. 174 Currently only the model's carbon cycle makes use of the spinup phase. Spinup 175 takes place prior to land use change or industrial emission inputs, and the main carbon 176 cycle moves from its initial, user-defined carbon pool values to a steady state in which 177 dC/dt < ε for all pools. The convergence criterion ε is user-definable; by default $\varepsilon = 1$ Tg C yr⁻¹. From its default values the preindustrial carbon cycle will typically stabilize in 300-178 179 400 time steps.

Hector can be forced to match its output to a user-supplied time series. This is helpful to isolate and test different components. Available constraints currently include atmospheric CO₂, global temperature anomaly, total ocean-atmosphere carbon

DRAFT

183	exchange, total land-atmosphere carbon exchange, and total radiative forcing. Most			
184	constraints operate by overwriting model-calculated values with user-supplied time			
185	series data during the run. The atmospheric $[CO_2]$ constraint operates slightly			
186	differently, as the global carbon cycle is subject to a continuous mass-balance check. As			
187	a result, when the user supplies a $[CO_2]$ record between arbitrary dates and orders the			
188	model to match it, the model <i>computes</i> [CO ₂] at each time step, and any deficit (surplus)			
189	in comparison with the constraint $[CO_2]$ is drawn from (added to) the deep ocean. The			
190	deep ocean holds the largest reservoir of carbon; therefore, small changes in this large			
191	pool have a negligible effect on the carbon cycle dynamics. When the model exits the			
192	constraint time period, atmospheric [CO ₂] again becomes fully prognostic.			
193	2.5 Code availability and dependencies			
194	All Hector code is open source and available at			
194 195	All Hector code is open source and available at <u>https://github.com/JGCRI/hector/</u> . The repository includes model code that can be			
195	https://github.com/JGCRI/hector/. The repository includes model code that can be			
195 196	<u>https://github.com/JGCRI/hector/</u> . The repository includes model code that can be compiled on Mac, Linux, and Windows, input files for the four Representative			
195 196 197	<u>https://github.com/JGCRI/hector/</u> . The repository includes model code that can be compiled on Mac, Linux, and Windows, input files for the four Representative Concentration Pathways (RCP) cases discussed in Section 5, R scripts to process model			
195 196 197 198	 <u>https://github.com/JGCRI/hector/</u>. The repository includes model code that can be compiled on Mac, Linux, and Windows, input files for the four Representative Concentration Pathways (RCP) cases discussed in Section 5, R scripts to process model output, and extensive documentation. Software dependencies are as limited as possible, 			
195 196 197 198 199	 <u>https://github.com/JGCRI/hector/</u>. The repository includes model code that can be compiled on Mac, Linux, and Windows, input files for the four Representative Concentration Pathways (RCP) cases discussed in Section 5, R scripts to process model output, and extensive documentation. Software dependencies are as limited as possible, with only the GNU Scientific Library (GSL, Gough, 2009) and the Boost C++ libraries 			
195 196 197 198 199 200	https://github.com/JGCRI/hector/. The repository includes model code that can be compiled on Mac, Linux, and Windows, input files for the four Representative Concentration Pathways (RCP) cases discussed in Section 5, R scripts to process model output, and extensive documentation. Software dependencies are as limited as possible, with only the GNU Scientific Library (GSL, Gough, 2009) and the Boost C++ libraries (http://www.boost.org) required. HTML documentation can be automatically generated			
195 196 197 198 199 200 201	https://github.com/JGCRI/hector/. The repository includes model code that can be compiled on Mac, Linux, and Windows, input files for the four Representative Concentration Pathways (RCP) cases discussed in Section 5, R scripts to process model output, and extensive documentation. Software dependencies are as limited as possible, with only the GNU Scientific Library (GSL, Gough, 2009) and the Boost C++ libraries (http://www.boost.org) required. HTML documentation can be automatically generated from the code using the Doxygen tool (http://www.doxygen.org). All these tools and			

205 target. Unit testing allows individual units of source code to be tested in a standardized

and automatic manner, ensuring that they behave as expected after changes are made

to the model source code. Current tests verify the behavior of the model coupler

208 (message passing and dependency calculation); reading of input; time series; logging;

and units checking. This functionality requires the 'googletest' library

- 210 (http://code.google.com/p/googletest).
- 211

3.0 Carbon Cycle

213 In the model's default terrestrial carbon cycle, terrestrial vegetation, detritus,

and soil are linked with each other and the atmosphere by first-order differential

equations (Figure 2). Vegetation net primary production is a function of atmospheric

216 [CO₂] and temperature. Carbon flows from the vegetation to detritus and then to soil,

217 losing fractions to heterotrophic respiration on the way. Land-use change emissions are

218 specified as inputs. An 'earth' pool debits carbon emitted as anthropogenic emissions,

allowing a continual mass-balance check across the entire carbon cycle.

220 More formally, any change in atmospheric carbon, and thus [CO₂], occurs as a

221 function of anthropogenic fossil fuel and industrial emissions (F_A), land-use change

222 emissions (F_{LC}), and the atmosphere-ocean (F_O) and atmosphere-land (F_L) carbon fluxes.

223 The atmosphere is treated as a single well-mixed box whose rate of change is:

$$\frac{dC_{atm}}{dt} = F_A(t) + F_{LC}(t) - F_O(t) - F_L(t)$$
(1)

Note that the carbon cycle is solved under indeterminate time steps
(represented in the text by equations with d/dt), while most other submodels of Hector

DRAFT

are solved under a fixed time step of 1 year (equations with Δ). Future versions of Hector will incorporate indeterminate time steps within all components of the model. The overall terrestrial carbon balance (Equation 2) excluding user-specified land-use change fluxes at time *t* is the difference between net primary production (*NPP*) and heterotrophic respiration (*RH*). This is summed over user-specified *n* groups (each typically regarded as a latitude band, biome, or political unit), with $n \ge 1$:

$$F_L(t) = \sum_{i=1}^n NPP_i(t) - RH_i(t)$$
⁽²⁾

Note that *NPP* here is assumed to include non-LUC disturbance effects (e.g., fire), for
which there is currently no separate term. For each biome *i*, *NPP* is computed as a
function of its preindustrial values *NPP*₀, current atmospheric carbon *C*_{atm}, and the
biome's temperature anomaly *T*_i, while heterotrophic respiration RH depends upon the
pool sizes of detritus (C_d) and soil (C_s), and global temperatures:

$$NPP_i(t) = NPP_0 * f(C_{atm}, \beta_i))$$
(3)

$$f(C_{atm}, \beta_i) = 1 + \beta_i (\log\left(\frac{C_{atm}}{C_0}\right))$$
(4)

$$RH_{s,d}(t) = C_{s,d} * f_{rs,rd} * Q_{10i}^{T_i(t)/10}$$
(5)

$$T_i(t) = T_G(t) * \delta_i \tag{6}$$

These are commonly used formulations: *NPP* is modified by a user-specified
carbon fertilization parameter, *θ* (Piao et al., 2013), that is constant in time but not
necessarily in space. For example, users can define separate *θ* values for different
biomes. *RH* changes are controlled by a biome-specific Q₁₀ value. Biomes can
experience temperature changes at rates that differ from the global mean *T*_G, controlled

DRAFT

242 by a user specified temperature factor δ_{l} Note that in equation (5), soil RH depends on a 243 running mean of past temperatures, representing the slower propagation of heat 244 through soil strata. Land carbon pools (vegetation, detritus, and soil) change as a result 245 of NPP, RH, and land-use change fluxes, whose effects are partitioned among these 246 carbon pools. In addition, carbon flows from vegetation to detritus and to soil (Figure 2). 247 Partitioning fractions (f) control the flux quantities between pools (Table 2). For 248 simplicity Equations 7-9 omit the time t and biome-specific i notations, but each pool is 249 tracked separately for each biome at each time step:

$$\frac{dC_V}{dt} = NPPf_{nv} - C_V(f_{vd} + f_{vs}) - F_{LC}f_{lv}$$
⁽⁷⁾

$$\frac{dC_D}{dt} = NPPf_{nd} + C_V f_{vd} - C_D f_{ds} - RH_{det} - F_{LC} f_{ld}$$
(8)

$$\frac{dC_S}{dt} = NPPf_{ns} + C_V f_{vs} + C_D f_{ds} - RH_{soil} - F_{LC} f_{ls}$$
⁽⁹⁾

250 The ocean-atmosphere carbon flux is the sum of the ocean's surface fluxes (F_i) 251 (currently n=2, high and low latitude surface box):

$$F_{0}(t) = \sum_{i=1}^{n} F_{i}(t)$$
(10)

The surface fluxes of each individual box are directly calculated from an ocean chemistry submodel described in detail by Hartin et al. (in prep). We model the nonlinearity of the inorganic carbon cycle, calculating pCO₂, pH, and carbonate saturations based on equations from Zeebe and Wolf-Gladrow, (2001). The flux of CO₂ for each box *i* is calculated by:

$$F_i(t) = k \alpha \, \Delta \rho CO_2 \tag{11}$$

DRAFT

257	where k is the CO ₂ gas-transfer velocity, α is the solubility of CO ₂ in water based on			
258	salinity, temperature, and pressure, and ΔpCO_2 is the atmosphere-ocean gradient of			
259	pCO_2 (Takahashi et al., 2009). The calculation of pCO_2 in each surface box is based on			
260	the concentration of CO_2 in the ocean and its solubility (a function of temperature,			
261	salinity, and pressure). At steady state, the cold high latitude surface box (>55°, subpolar			
262	2 gyres) acts as a sink of carbon from the atmosphere, while the warm low latitude			
263	surface box (<55°) off gases carbon back to the atmosphere. Temperatures of the			
264	surface boxes are linearly related to atmospheric global temperatures (see section 4.1),			
265	$T_{HL} = \Delta T - 13$ and $T_{LL} = \Delta T + 7$ (Lenton, 2000). The ocean model, modeled after Lenton et			
266	al. (2000) and Knox and McElroy (1984), circulates carbon through four boxes (two			
267	surface, one intermediate depth, one deep), via water mass advection and exchange,			
268	simulating a simple thermohaline circulation (Figure 2). At steady state, approximately			
269	100Pg of carbon are transferred from the high latitude surface box to the deep box			
270	based on the volume of the box and transport in Sv ($10^6 \text{ m}^3 \text{ s}^{-1}$) between the boxes. The			
271	change in carbon of any box <i>i</i> is given by the fluxes in and out, with $F_{atm_{2}i}$ as the			
272	atmosphere-ocean carbon flux:			

$$\frac{dC_i}{dt} = \sum_{j=1}^{in} F_{j \to i} - \sum_{j=1}^{out} F_{i \to j} + F_{atm \to i}$$
⁽¹²⁾

As the model advances, the carbon in PgC is converted to dissolved inorganic carbon
(DIC) in each box. The new DIC values are used within the chemistry submodel to
calculate pCO₂ values at the next time step.

276 **3.1 Adaptive-time step solver**

DRAFT

277 The fundamental time step in Hector is currently one year, and most model 278 components are solved at this resolution. The carbon cycle, however, operates on a 279 variable time step, ensuring accurate ODE solutions, even under high-emissions 280 scenarios. This will also allow future sub-annual applications where desired. The 281 adaptive time step accomplished using the *qsl odeiv2 evolve apply* solver package of 282 GSL 1.16, which varies the time step to keep truncation error within a specific tolerance 283 when advancing the model. Thus all the carbon cycle components handle indeterminate 284 time steps less than or equal to 1 year, and can signal the solver if a too-large time step 285 is leading to instability. The solver then re-retries the solution, using a series of smaller 286 steps. From the coupler's point of view, however, the entire model continues to 287 advance in annual increments.

4.0 Other Components

289

4.1 Global Atmospheric Temperature

290 Near surface global atmospheric temperature is calculated by:

$$\Delta T(t) = \lambda * RF(t) - F_H(t)$$
(13)

where the user-specified λ is the climate feedback parameter, defined as $\lambda = S'/S$, S' is the climate sensitivity parameter (3 K) and S is the equilibrium climate sensitivity for a doubling of CO₂ (3.7 Wm⁻²) (Knutti and Hegerl, 2008). *RF* is the total radiative forcing and *F_H* is the ocean heat flux. *F_H* is calculated by a simple sigmoidal expression of the ocean heat uptake efficiency *k* (W m⁻² K⁻¹) that decreases with increasing global

DRAFT

temperatures) multiplied by the atmospheric temperature change prior to the ocean's removal of heat from the atmosphere (T_H) (Raper et al., 2002).

$$\Delta F_H(t) = k * \Delta T_H(t) \tag{14}$$

298 As global temperatures rise, the uptake capacity of the ocean may diminish, simulating 299 both a saturation of heat in the surface and a slowdown in ocean circulation with 300 increased temperatures. Finally, the temperature effects from atmospheric $[CO_2]$ are 301 lagged in time, as there are numerous real-world processes not simulated in Hector buffering the temperature effects of increasing atmospheric $[CO_2]$. 302 303 4.2 Radiative Forcing 304 Radiative forcing is calculated from a series of atmospheric greenhouse gases, aerosols, and pollutants (Eq. 15-16, 18-22, 25, 29-30). Radiative forcing is reported as 305 306 the relative radiative forcing. The base year user-specified forcings are subtracted from 307 the total radiative forcing to yield a forcing relative to the base year (1750). 308 4.2.1. CO₂ Radiative forcing from atmospheric $[CO_2]$ in W m⁻² is calculated based on 309

310 Meinshausen et al. (2011a):

$$RF_{CO_2} = 5.35 * \log \frac{Ca}{C0}$$
 (15)

311 where, 5.35 W m⁻² is a scaling parameter from Myhre et al. (1998), *Ca* is the 312 current atmospheric $[CO_2]$ in ppmv and *CO* is the preindustrial $[CO_2]$ in ppmv.

4.2.2 Halocarbons

314 The halocarbon component of the model can accept an arbitrary number of gas 315 species, each characterized by a name, a lifetime τ (yr), a radiative forcing efficiency α

DRAFT

316 (W m⁻² pptv⁻¹), an optional user-specified preindustrial concentration (pptv), and a 317 molar mass (g). For each gas, its concentration (C_i) at time t is then computed based on 318 a specified emissions time series E, assuming an exponential decay from the 319 atmosphere:

$$C(t) = C_0 * \exp\left(-\frac{1}{T}\right) + E * T * \left(1 - \exp\left(-\frac{1}{T}\right)\right)$$
(16)

E is corrected for atmospheric dry air mole constant (1.8) and the molar mass of each
halocarbon. The default model input files include these parameters and a time series of
emissions for C2F6, CCl4, CF4, CFC11, CFC12, CFC113, CFC114, CFC115, CH3Br, CH3CCl3,
CH3Cl, HCF22, HCF141b, HCF142b, HFC23, HFC32, HFC125, HFC134a, HFC143a,
HFC227ea, HFC245ca, HFC245fa, HFC4310, SF6, halon1211, halon1301, and halon2402.
Radiative forcing by halocarbons, and other gases controlled under the Montreal
Protocol, SF₆, and ozone are calculated via:

$$\mathsf{RF} = \alpha \left[\mathsf{C}(\mathsf{t}) \right] \tag{17}$$

328 where α is the radiative efficiency (input parameters) in W m⁻² ppbv⁻¹, and C is the 329 atmospheric concentration.

4.2.3 Ozone

Tropospheric ozone concentrations are calculated from the CH₄ concentration and the emissions of three primary pollutants: NO_x, CO, and NMVOCs, modified from Tanaka et al. (2007a):

$$O_{3t} = (5.0 * \ln[CH_4]) + (0.125 * ENO_x) + (0.0011 * ECO)$$
(18)
+ (0.0033 * EVOC)

where the constants are the ozone sensitivity factors for each of the precursors (Ehhalt
et al., 2001). The radiative forcing of tropospheric ozone is calculated from a linear

relationship using a radiative efficiency factor (Joos et al., 2001a):

$$RF_{O3} = 0.042 * [O_3] \tag{19}$$

4.2.4 BC and OC

340 The radiative forcing from black and organic carbon is a function their emissions (*EBC* 341 and *EOC*).

$$RF_{BC} = 0.0743 \ Wm^{-2}Tg^{-1} * EBC$$
⁽²⁰⁾

$$RF_{OC} = -0.0128 Wm^{-2}Tg^{-1} * EOC$$
(21)

342 The coefficients include both indirect and direct forcings of black and organic carbon

343 (fossil fuel and biomass) (Bond et al., 2013, table C1).

344 **4.2.5 Sulphate Aerosols**

The radiative forcing from sulphate aerosols is a combination of the direct and indirectforcings (Joos et al., 2001a).

$$RF_{SOx Direct} = -0.35 Wm^{-2} * \frac{ESO_{x_t}}{ESO_{x_{t0}}}$$
(22)

$$RF_{SOx Indirect} = -0.6 Wm^{-2} * \frac{\left(\ln(ESN) + EeSO_{x_t}\right)}{ESN}$$

$$* \left(ln \frac{ESN + EeSO_{x_{t0}}}{ESN}\right)^{-1}$$
(23)

The direct forcing by sulphate aerosols is proportional to the anthropogenic sulphur
emissions (GgS yr⁻¹) divided by the sulphate emissions from 2000. The indirect forcing by
sulphate aerosols is a function of the anthropogenic and natural sulphur emissions.

DRAFT

350 Natural sulphur emissions, denoted by *ESN*, are equal to 42000 Gg S. A time series of

351 annual mean volcanic stratospheric aerosol forcing (W m⁻²) is supplied from

352 Meinshausen et al. (2011b) and added to the indirect and direct forcing for a total

353 sulphate forcing.

4.2.6 Methane (CH₄)

The change in [CH₄] is calculated directly from CH₄ emissions, and sinks of CH₄ in the the troposphere (based on the lifetime of OH), stratosphere, and soil based on Wigley et al. (2002).

$$\Delta CH_4 = \frac{E(CH_4)}{2.78} - \frac{[CH_4]}{T_{OH}} - \frac{[CH_4]}{T_{strat}} - \frac{[CH_4]}{T_{soil}}$$
(24)

where E is total CH₄ emissions (Tg yr⁻¹) from both natural and anthropogenic sources, 2.78 (Tg ppb⁻¹) is the conversion factor, and T are the lifetimes of the tropospheric sink (T_{OH}), the stratospheric sink (T_{strat} = 120 year), and the soil sink (T_{soil} = 160 year). Note that within Hector, natural emissions are held at a constant 300 Tg yr⁻¹.

The lifetime of OH is a function of [CH₄], and the emissions of NOx, CO and VOC,
based on Tanaka et al. (2007a).

$$\ln(OH)_{t} = -0.32 \left(\ln[CH_{4}]_{t} - \ln[CH_{4}]_{t0} \right) + 0.0042 \left(E(NO_{x})_{t} \right)$$

$$- \left(E(NO_{x})_{t0} \right) - 0.000105 \left(E(CO)_{t} - (E(CO)_{t0}) \right)$$

$$- 0.00315 \left(E(VOC)_{t} - (E(VOC)_{t0}) \right)$$
(25)

364 The radiative forcing equation for CH_4 (Joos et al., 2001a) is a function of the 365 concentrations (ppbv) of both CH_4 and N_2O :

DRAFT

$$RF_{CH_4} = 0.036 Wm^{-2} \left[\sqrt{[CH_4](t)} - \sqrt{[CH_4](t_0)} \right]$$

$$- f[CH_4(t), N_2O(t_0)] - f[CH_4(t_0), N_2O(t_0)]$$
(26)

366 The function f accounts for the overlap in CH₄ and N₂O in their bands is:

$$f(M,N) = 0.47$$
 (27)

$$(MN)^{1.52}$$
 * $(MN)^{0.75}$ + $(5.31 \times 10^{-15}) \times M$

4.2.7 N₂O

The change in [N₂O] is a function of N₂O emissions, and the lifetime of N₂O based on
Ward and Mahowald (2014).

$$\Delta N_2 O = \frac{E(N_2 O)}{4.8} - \frac{[N_2 O]}{T_{N_2 O}}$$
(28)

370 where E is total N₂O emissions (Tg N yr⁻¹), both natural and anthropogenic, 4.8 (Tg N 371 ppbv⁻¹) is the conversion factor, and T_{N2O} is the lifetime of N₂O. We set natural 372 emissions of N₂O to linearly decrease from 11 Tg N yr⁻¹ in 1765, to 8 Tg N yr⁻¹ in 2000 373 and are then held constant at 8 Tg N yr⁻¹ to 2300. The lifetime of N₂O is a function of its 374 initial lifetime (T₀) and concentration ([N₂O]_{t0}).

$$T_{N_2O} = T_0 * \left(\frac{[N_2O]_t}{[N_2O]_{t0}}\right)^{-0.05}$$
(29)

376 concentration (ppbv) of both CH_4 and N_2O :

$$RF_{N_2O} = 0.12 Wm^{-2} \left[\sqrt{[N_2O]_t} - \sqrt{[N_2O]_{t0}} \right] - f[CH_4(t_0), N_2O(t)]$$
(30)
$$- f[CH_4(t_0), N_2O(t_0)]$$

DRAFT

The function *f* accounts for the overlap in CH_4 and N_2O in their bands is the same as equation 27.

379

4.2.8 Stratospheric H₂O from CH₄ oxidation:

380 The radiative forcing from stratospheric H₂O is a function of the [CH₄] (Tanaka et al.,

381 2007a). The coefficient 0.05 is from Joos et al. (2001a) based on the fact that the forcing

382 contribution from stratospheric H_2O is about 5% of the total CH_4 forcing (IPCC, 2001).

383 The 0.036 value of the coefficient corresponds to the same value used in the CH₄

384 radiative forcing equation.

$$RF_{stratH20} = 0.05 * \left\{ 0.036 Wm^{-2} * \left(\sqrt{[CH_4]_t} - \sqrt{[CH_4]_{t0}} \right) \right\}$$
(31)

385

386 5.0 Model Experiments and Data Sources

387 A critical test of Hector's performance is to compare the major climatic variables 388 calculated in Hector, e.g., atmospheric [CO₂], radiative forcing, and atmospheric 389 temperature, to observational records and both simple and complex climate models. 390 Within this study, Hector is run under prescribed emissions from 1850 to 2300 for all 391 four Representative Concentration Pathways (RCPs), freely available at 392 http://tntcat.iiasa.ac.at/RcpDb/ (Moss et al., 2010; van Vuuren et al., 2007; Clarke et al., 393 2007; Wise et al., 2009; Riahi et al., 2007; Fujino et al., 2006; Hijioka et al., 2008; Smith 394 and Wigley, 2006). The RCPs are plausible future scenarios that were developed to 395 improve our understanding of the coupled human climate system. RCPs by definition

DRAFT

are concentration pathways; however, for all experiments within this manuscript we usethe corresponding emissions trajectories from each RCP as input for Hector.

398 Comparison data was obtained from a series of models. We compared Hector 399 results to MAGICC, a SCM widely used in the scientific and IAM communities, for global 400 variables such as atmospheric CO_2 , radiative forcing, and temperature (e.g., Raper et al., 401 2001; Wigley, 1995; Meinshausen et al., 2011a). We also compare Hector to a suite of eleven Earth System Models included in the 5th Coupled Model Intercomparison Project 402 403 (CMIP5) archive (Taylor et al., 2012) (Table 3). All CMIP5 data were converted to yearly 404 global averages from the historical period through the RCPs and their extensions. One 405 standard deviation of the annual global averages and the CMIP5 model range were 406 calculated for each variable using the RCMIP5 (<u>http://github.cm/JGCRI/RCMIP5</u>) 407 package in R. All CMIP5 variables used in this study are from model runs with 408 prescribed atmospheric concentrations, except for comparisons involving atmospheric 409 [CO₂] which are from the emissions driven scenario (esmHistorical and esmRCP8.5) 410 (Figures 3 and 5). We acknowledge that this comparison, between an emissions-forced 411 model (Hector) and concentration-forced models (CMIP5), is not perfect. However, very 412 few CMIP5 models were run under prescribed emissions scenarios. 413 We compare Hector to observations of atmospheric [CO₂] from Law Dome 414 (1010-1975) and Mauna Loa (1958 – 2008), (Keeling and Whorf, 2005; Etheridge et al., 415 1996). Global temperature anomalies are from HadCRUT4 (Morice et al., 2012). 416 Observations of air-sea and air-land fluxes are from the Global Carbon Project (GCP) (Le 417 Quéré et al., 2013). Lastly, observations of surface ocean pH are from Bermuda Atlantic

DRAFT

418 Time Series (BATS) and Hawaii Ocean Time Series (HOTS) (Bates, 2007; Fujieki et al.,

419 2013).

420

421 **6.0 Results and Discussion**

422 **6.1 Historical**

423 A critical test of Hector's performance is how well it compares to historical and 424 present day climate from observations, MAGICC, and a suite of CMIP5 models. Rates of 425 change and root mean square errors were calculated for Hector's primary outputs, 426 which are summarized in **Table 4**. After spinup is complete in Hector, atmospheric $[CO_2]$ 427 in 1850 is 286.0 ppmv, which compares well with observations from Law Dome of 285.2 428 ppmv. Hector captures the global trends in atmospheric $[CO_2]$ (Figure 3) with an 429 average root mean square error (RMSE) of 2.85 ppmv (Table 4a), when compared to 430 observations, MAGICC6, and CMIP5 data from 1850-2005. Rate of change of 431 atmospheric [CO₂] from 1850-2005 is slightly lower than the observations, MAGICC6, 432 and CMIP5. Hector can be forced to match atmospheric [CO₂] records (section 2.4), but 433 we disabled this feature to highlight the full performance of the model. Note however, 434 that in the MAGICC6 results a similar feature was used to force the output to match the 435 historical atmospheric [CO₂] record. 436 Historical global atmospheric temperature anomalies (relative to 1850) are 437 compared across Hector, MAGICC6, CMIP5, and observations from HadCRUT4 (Figure 4). Atmospheric temperature change from Hector (0.98 °C) over the period 1850 to 438 439 2005 closely match the CMIP5 temperature change (1.01 °C), both slightly higher than

DRAFT

the observational record. Over this time period a Hector has an average RMSE of 0.14
°C. Note that simple climate models do not aim to capture temperature variations due
to interannual/decadal variability found in ESMs or the real world; instead they simulate
the overall trends in global mean temperature change.

444

6.2 Future Projections

445 Hector's strengths lie within policy relevant time scales of decades to centuries, 446 and here we compare Hector to MAGICC and CMIP5 under differing future climate 447 projections. Results from all four RCPs are broadly similar when comparing Hector, to 448 MAGICC6, and CMIP5; we display here RCP8.5 results as representative. Studies suggest 449 that 80% of the anthropogenic CO_2 emissions have an average atmospheric lifetime of 450 300-450 years (Archer et al., 1997; Rogner, 1997; Archer, 2005). Hector has all the 451 necessary components to model the climate system from present day through the next 452 approximately 300 years. Figure 5 highlights historical trends in atmospheric $[CO_2]$, 453 along with projections of atmospheric [CO₂] under esmRCP8.5 from 1850 to 2100. Note 454 that the emissions forced scenario only extends to 2100 and not to 2300 like the 455 concentration forced scenarios (e.g., Figure 8). Both Hector and MAGICC6 are on the 456 low end of the CMIP5 median, but fall within one standard deviation and model range, 457 with a RMSE of 9.0 ppmv (Table 4b). 458 The CMIP5 archive does not provide emissions prescribed scenarios for all RCPs; 459 we can only compare atmospheric $[CO_2]$ from Hector with MAGICC6 under all four RCP 460 scenarios out to 2300 (Figure 6). Hector's change in [CO₂] (1472.13 ppmv) from 1850 to

- 461 2300 is slightly lower than MAGICC6 (1600.0 ppmv) for RCP 8.5. This is most likely due

DRAFT

462 to different representations of the global carbon cycle. We compare Hector to 463 MAGICC6 for changes in radiative forcing under the four RCPs (Figure 7). Radiative 464 forcing was not provided within the CMIP5 archive and therefore we can only compare Hector and MAGICC6. Over the period 1850 to 2300 Hector (12.80 Wm⁻²) and MAGICC6 465 (12.24 Wm⁻²) are comparable in their change in radiative forcing, with a RMSE of 0.26 W 466 467 m⁻². One noticeable difference between MAGICC6 and Hector during the historical 468 period is the decreases in radiative forcing. This is due to the effects of volcanic 469 emissions on radiative forcing. For simplicity, we have chosen to run Hector without 470 these effects. 471 Figure 8 compares global temperature anomalies from Hector to MAGICC6 and 472 CMIP5 over the four RCPs, from 2005 to 2300. Hector simulates the CMIP5 median 473 more closely than MAGICC6 across all four RCPs, with a temperature change under RCP 474 8.5 for Hector of 8.59 °C, compared to MAGICC6 of 7.30 °C, while the temperature 475 change for CMIP5 is 9.57 °C (Table 4c). To highlight this close comparison, temperature 476 change over the entire record (1850-2300) for Hector is 9.58 °C, which is within 1.0 °C of 477 the CMIP5 median, while MAGGIC6's temperature change is greater than 2.5 °C away from the CMIP5 median. 478 479 Figures 9 and 10 present a detailed view of carbon fluxes under RCP 8.5, for 480 CMIP5 and observations (negative represents carbon flux to the atmosphere). The 481 ocean is a major sink of carbon through 2100, becoming less effective with time in both Hector and the CMIP5 models. MAGICC6 does not include air-sea fluxes in its output, 482 483 and because it is not open source we were unable to obtain these values. Therefore, we

DRAFT

484 compare air-sea fluxes of CO₂ to MAGICC5.3, updated with explicit BC and OC forcing as 485 described in Smith and Bond (2014). Hector's calculation of air-sea fluxes is within the 486 large CMIP5 model range up to 2100. However, after that Hector peaks close to 2150, 487 while the CMIP5 models are beginning to decline. One potential reason for this 488 discrepancy after 2100 is that in this version of Hector, we do not simulate changes in 489 ocean circulation, potentially biasing fluxes too high after 2100. Most ESMs in CMIP5 490 show a weakening of the Atlantic meridional overturning circulation by 2100 between 491 15% and 60% under RCP 8.5 (Cheng et al., 2013). A slowdown in ocean circulation may 492 result in less carbon uptake by the oceans. Another potential reason for this bias is 493 Hector's constant pole to equator ocean temperature gradient. Studies show that the 494 Artic is warming faster than the rest of the globe (e.g., Bintanja and van der Linden, 495 2013; Holland and Bitz, 2003; Bekryaev et al., 2010). A warmer high latitude surface 496 ocean in Hector would suppress the uptake of carbon, potentially bringing the air-sea 497 fluxes closer to the CMIP5 median after 2100.

498 CMIP models tend to show huge divergences in their land responses to changing 499 climate (e.g., Friedlingstein et al., 2006), which is evident by the large range in CMIP5 500 models (**Figure 10**). Hector simulates the general trends, of increasing carbon sink and 501 then a gradual decline to a carbon source after 2100. Both land and ocean fluxes within 502 Hector agree well the observations from Le Queré et al., (2013).

503 One feature in Hector that is unique amongst SCMs is its ability to actively solve 504 the carbonate system in the upper ocean (Hartin et al, in prep). This feature allows us 505 to predict changes ocean acidification, calcium carbonate saturations and other

DRAFT

506 carbonate system parameters. **Figure 11** shows low latitude (<55°) pH for Hector 507 compared to CMIP5 and observations from 1850 to 2100 under RCP 8.5. The model 508 projects a significant drop in pH from present day through 2100, which may lead to 509 detrimental effects on marine ecosystems (e.g., Fabry et al., 2008).

510

511 7.0 Conclusions

512 Hector reproduces the large-scale couplings and feedbacks on the climate 513 system between the atmosphere, ocean, and land, falling within the range of the CMIP5 514 model and matching MAGICC. It does not simulate the fine details or parameterizations 515 found in large-scale, complex ESMs, but instead represents the most critical global 516 processes in a reduced-complexity form. This allows for fast execution times, ease of 517 understanding, and straightforward analysis of the model output. 518 Two of Hector's key features are its open source nature and modular design. 519 This allows the user to edit the input files and code at will, for example to 520 enable/disable/replace components, or include components not found within the core 521 version of Hector. For example, a user can design a new submodel (e.g., sea-ice) to 522 answer specific climate questions relating to that process. Hector is hosted on a widely-523 used open source software repository (Github), and thus changes and improvements 524 can be easily shared with the scientific community. Because of these critical features, 525 Hector has the potential to be a key analytical tool in both the policy and scientific 526 communities. We welcome user input and encourage use, modifications, and 527 collaborations with Hector.

DRAFT

528	While Hector has many strengths, the current 1.0 version has some limitations.			
529	For example, Hector does not currently simulate terrestrial gross primary production, a			
530	key metric of comparison to e.g. the FLUXNET database. Also, Hector does not have			
531	differential radiative forcing and atmospheric temperature calculations over land and			
532	ocean. This may be a problem, as land responds to changes in emissions of greenhouse			
533	gases and aerosols much quicker than the ocean (Hansen et al., 2005). Hector does not			
534	explicitly deal with oceanic heat uptake, except via a simple empirical formula. Surface			
535	temperatures are calculated based on a linear relationship with atmospheric			
536	temperature and we assume a constant pole to equator temperature gradient. We			
537	acknowledge that this assumption may not hold true if the poles warm faster than the			
538	equator.			
539	Future plans with Hector include addressing some of the above limitations and			
540	conducting numerous scientific experiments, using Hector as a stand-alone simple			
541	climate carbon-cycle model. It is also being incorporated into Pacific Northwest			
542	National Laboratory's Global Change Assessment Model for policy-relevant experiments.			
543	Hector has the ability to be a key analytical tool used across many scientific and policy			
544	communities due to its modern software architecture, open source, and object-oriented			
545	structure.			
516				

Code Availability

DRAFT

548	Hector is freely available at	https://github.com/JGCRI/hector .	The specific Hector v1.0
-----	-------------------------------	-----------------------------------	--------------------------

- 549 referenced in this paper, as well as code to reproduce all figures and results shown here,
- 550 is available at <u>https://github.com/JGCRI/hector/releases/tag/v1.0</u>
- 551 Author contributions
- 552 C.A.H. and B.P.B.-L. developed the ocean and terrestrial carbon models, respectively,
- and led the overall development of Hector. R.P.L. and P.P. wrote critical code for
- 554 Hector's coupler and carbon cycle solver. A.S. helped with the development of the
- atmospheric forcing components. C.A.H. wrote the manuscript with contributions from
- all co-authors.
- 557

558 Acknowledgements

- 559 This research is based on work supported by the U.S. Department of Energy, Office of
- 560 Science, Integrated Assessment Research Program. The Pacific Northwest National
- 561 Laboratory is operated for DOE by Battelle Memorial Institute under contract DE-AC05-
- 562 76RL01830.

563 **References**:

- Anthoff, D., and Tol, R. S. J.: The income elasticity of the impact of climate change, Is
- the Environment a Luxury? An inquiry into the relationship between environment and
- 566 income, edited by: Tiezzi, S., and Martini, C., Routledge, 2014.
- 567 Applegate, P. J., Kirchner, N., Stone, E. J., Keller, K., and Greve, R.: An assessment of
- key model parametric uncertainties in projections of Greenland Ice Sheet behavior, The
 Cryosphere, 6, 589-606, 10.5194/tc-6-589-2012, 2012.
- 570 Archer, D., Kheshgi, H., and Maier-Reimer, E.: Multiple timescales for neutralization of
- 571 fossil fuel CO2, Geophysical Research Letters, 24, 405-408, 10.1029/97GL00168, 1997.
- 572 Archer, D.: Fate of fossil fuel CO2 in geologic time, Journal of Geophysical Research:
- 573 Oceans, 110, C09S05, 10.1029/2004JC002625, 2005.
- 574 Bates, N. R.: Interannual variability of the oceanic CO2 sink in the subtropical gyre of the
- 575 North Atlantic Ocean over the last 2 decades, Journal of Geophysical Research: Oceans,
- 576 112, C09013, 10.1029/2006JC003759, 2007.
- 577 Bekryaev, R. V., Polyakov, I. V., and Alexeev, V. A.: Role of Polar Amplification in
- 578 Long-Term Surface Air Temperature Variations and Modern Arctic Warming, Journal of 579 Climate, 23, 3888-3906, 10.1175/2010JCLI3297.1, 2010.
- Bintanja, R., and van der Linden, E. C.: The changing seasonal climate in the Arctic, Sci.
 Rep., 3,
- 582 <u>http://www.nature.com/srep/2013/130327/srep01556/abs/srep01556.html#supplementary</u>
 583 <u>-information</u>, 2013.
- 584 Bond-Lamberty, B., Calvin, K., Jones, A. D., Mao, J., Patel, P., Shi, X., Thomson, A.,
- 585 Thornton, P., and Zhou, Y.: Coupling earth system and integrated assessment models: the
- 586 problem of steady state, Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., 7, 1499-1524, 10.5194/gmdd-7-587 1499-2014, 2014.
- 588 Bond, T. C., Doherty, S. J., Fahey, D. W., Forster, P. M., Berntsen, T., DeAngelo, B. J.,
- 589 Flanner, M. G., Ghan, S., Kärcher, B., Koch, D., Kinne, S., Kondo, Y., Quinn, P. K.,
- 590 Sarofim, M. C., Schultz, M. G., Schulz, M., Venkataraman, C., Zhang, H., Zhang, S.,
- 591 Bellouin, N., Guttikunda, S. K., Hopke, P. K., Jacobson, M. Z., Kaiser, J. W., Klimont,
- 592 Z., Lohmann, U., Schwarz, J. P., Shindell, D., Storelvmo, T., Warren, S. G., and Zender,
- 593 C. S.: Bounding the role of black carbon in the climate system: A scientific assessment,
- 594 Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres, 118, 5380-5552, 10.1002/jgrd.50171, 595 2013.
- 596 Bouwman, A. F., Hoek, K. W. v. d., Drecht, G. V., and Eickhout, B.: World Livestock
- and crop production systems, land use and environment between 1970 and 2030, Rural
- 598 Lands, Africulture and Climate beyond 2015: A new prespective on suture land use
- 599 patterns, edited by: Brouwer, F., and McCarl, B., Springer, Dordrecht, 2006.
- 600 Calvin, K., Clarke, L., Edmonds, J., Eom, J., Hejazi, M., Kim, S., Kyle, G., Link, R.,
- Patel, P., Smith, S., and Wise, M.: GCAM Wiki Documentation, PNNL-20809, Pacific
 Northwest National Laboratory, Richland WA, 2011.
- 603 Castruccio, S., McInerney, D. J., Stein, M. L., Crouch, F. L., Jacob, R. L., and Moyer, E.
- 604 J.: Statistical Emulation of Climate Model Projections Based on Precomputed GCM
- 605 Runs, Journal of Climate, 27, 2014.

- 606 Challenor, P.: Using emulators to estimate uncertainty in complex models, Uncertainty
- 607 Quantification in Scientific Computing, edited by: Dienstry, A. M., and Boisvert, R. F.,
- 608 Springer, IFIP AICT 377, 151-164 pp., 2012.
- 609 Cheng, W., Chiang, J. C. H., and Zhang, D.: Atlantic Meridional Overturning Circulation
- 610 (AMOC) in CMIP5 Models: RCP and Historical Simulations, Journal of Climate, 26,
- 611 7187-7197, 10.1175/JCLI-D-12-00496.1, 2013.
- 612 Clarke, L., J. Edmonds, H. Jacoby, H. Pitcher, Reilly, J., and Richels, R.: Scenarios of
- 613 Greenhouse Gas Emissions and Atmospheric Concentrations. Sub-report 2.1A of
- 614 Synthesis and Assessment Product 2.1, edited by: Research, U. S. C. C. S. P. a. t. S. o. G.
- 615 C., Department of Energy, Office of Biological & Environmental Research, Washington,
 616 7 DC., USA, 2007.
- 617 Collins, W. D., Craig, A. P., Truesdale, J. E., Di Vittorio, A. V., Jones, A. D., Bond-
- 618 Lamberty, B., Calvin, K. V., Edmonds, J. A., Kim, S. H., Thomson, A. M., Patel, P.,
- 619 Zhou, Y., Mao, J., Shi, X., Thornton, P. E., Chini, L. P., and Hurtt, G. C.: The integrated
- 620 Earth System Model (iESM): formulation and functionality, Geosci. Model Dev.
- 621 Discuss., 8, 381-427, 10.5194/gmdd-8-381-2015, 2015.
- 622 Denman, K. L., G. Brasseur, A. Chidthaisong, P. Ciais, P.M. Cox, R.E. Dickinson, D.
- 623 Hauglustaine, C. Heinze, E. Holland, D. Jacob, U. Lohmann, S Ramachandran, P.L. da
- 624 Silva Dias, S.C. Wofsy and X. Zhang: Climat Change 2007: The Physical Science Basis.,
- 625 edited by: Change, C. o. W. G. I. t. t. F. A. R. o. t. I. P. o. C., Cambridge University
- 626 Press, Cambridge, United Kingdom and New York, USA, 2007.
- 627 Di Vittorio, A. V., Chini, L. P., Bond-Lamberty, B., Mao, J., Shi, X., Truesdale, J., Craig,
- A., Calvin, K., Jones, A., Collins, W. D., Edmonds, J., Hurtt, G. C., Thornton, P., and
- 629 Thomson, A.: From land use to land cover: restoring the afforestation signal in a coupled
- 630 integrated assessment–earth system model and the implications for CMIP5 RCP
- 631 simulations, Biogeosciences, 11, 6435-6450, 10.5194/bg-11-6435-2014, 2014.
- E.P. White, E. B., Z.T. Brym, K.J. Locey, D.J. McGlinn: Nine simple ways to make it
- easier to (re)use your data, PeerJ PrePrints, 1:e7v2,
- 634 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.7287/peerj.preprints.7v2</u>, 2013.
- Edmonds, J., and Smith, S. J.: The Technology of Two Degrees. Avoiding Dangerous
- 636 Climate Change, edited by: Schellnhuber, H. J., Cramer, W., Nakicenovic, N., Wigley,
- 637 T., and Yohe, G., Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK, 2006.
- 638 Ehhalt, D., Prather, M. J., Dentener, F. J., Derwent, R., Dlugokencky, E. J., Holland, E.
- A., Isaksen, I. S., Katima, J., Kirchoff, V., Matson, P. A., and Wang, M.: Atmospheric
- 640 chemistry and greenhouse gases, in: Climate Change 2001: The Scientific Basis, edited
- by: Houghton, J. T., Ding, Y., Griggs, D. J., Noguer, M., van der Linden, L., Dai, X.,
- Maskell, K., and Johnson, C. A., Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK, 892,
- 643 2001.
- 644 Etheridge, D. M., Steele, L. P., Langenfelds, R. L., Francey, R. J., Barnola, J. M., and
- 645 Morgan, V. I.: Natural and anthropogenic changes in atmospheric CO2 over the last 1000
- 646 years from air in Antarctic ice and firn, Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres,
- 647 101, 4115-4128, 10.1029/95JD03410, 1996.
- 648 Fabry, V. J., Seibel, B. A., Feely, R. A., and Orr, J. C.: Impacts of ocean acidification on
- 649 marine fauna and ecosystem processes, ICES Journal of Marine Science: Journal du
- 650 Conseil, 65, 414-432, 10.1093/icesjms/fsn048, 2008.

- 651 Friedlingstein, P., Cox, P., Betts, R., Bopp, L., von Bloh, W., Brovkin, V., Cadule, P.,
- Doney, S., Eby, M., Fung, I., Bala, G., John, J., Jones, C., Joos, F., Kato, T., Kawamiya,
- 653 M., Knorr, W., Lindsay, K., Matthews, H. D., Raddatz, T., Rayner, P., Reick, C.,
- 654 Roeckner, E., Schnitzler, K. G., Schnur, R., Strassmann, K., Weaver, A. J., Yoshikawa,
- 655 C., and Zeng, N.: Climate–Carbon Cycle Feedback Analysis: Results from the C4MIP
- 656 Model Intercomparison, Journal of Climate, 19, 3337-3353, 10.1175/JCLI3800.1, 2006.
- 657 Friedlingstein, P., Meinshausen, M., Arora, V. K., Jones, C. D., Anav, A., Liddicoat, S.
- 658 K., and Knutti, R.: Uncertainties in CMIP5 Climate Projections due to Carbon Cycle
- 659 Feedbacks, Journal of Climate, 27, 511-526, 10.1175/JCLI-D-12-00579.1, 2014.
- Fujieki, L., Santiago-Mandujano, F., Fumar, C., Liukas, R., and Church, M.: Hawaii
 Ocean Time-series Program Data Report, 2013.
- 62 Fujino, J., Nair, R., Kainuma, M., Masui, T., and Matsuoka, Y.: Multi-gas mitigation
- analysis on stabilization scenarios using AIM global model, Multigas Mitigation and
 Climate Policy. The Energy Journal, Special Issue, 2006.
- Hansen, J., Sato, M., Ruedy, R., Nazarenko, L., Lacis, A., Schmidt, G. A., Russell, G.,
- Aleinov, I., Bauer, M., Bauer, S., Bell, N., Cairns, B., Canuto, V., Chandler, M., Cheng,
- 667 Y., Del Genio, A., Faluvegi, G., Fleming, E., Friend, A., Hall, T., Jackman, C., Kelley,
- 668 M., Kiang, N., Koch, D., Lean, J., Lerner, J., Lo, K., Menon, S., Miller, R., Minnis, P.,
- 669 Novakov, T., Oinas, V., Perlwitz, J., Perlwitz, J., Rind, D., Romanou, A., Shindell, D.,
- 670 Stone, P., Sun, S., Tausnev, N., Thresher, D., Wielicki, B., Wong, T., Yao, M., and
- 671 Zhang, S.: Efficacy of climate forcings, Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres,
- 672 110, D18104, 10.1029/2005JD005776, 2005.
- Hartin, C. A., Bond-Lamberty, B., and Patel, P.: Projections of ocean acidification over
 three centuries using a carbonate chemsitry box model, Biogeosciences, in prep.
- 675 Harvey, L. D. D., and Schneider, S. H.: Transient climate response to external forcing on
- 676 100–104 year time scales part 1: Experiments with globally averaged, coupled,
- atmosphere and ocean energy balance models, Journal of Geophysical Research:
- 678 Atmospheres, 90, 2191-2205, 10.1029/JD090iD01p02191, 1985.
- Heron, M., Hanson, V., and Ricketts, I.: Open source and accessibility: advantages and
- 680 limitations, Journal of Interaction Science, 1, 2, 10.1186/2194-0827-1-2, 2013.
- 681 Hijioka, Y., Matsuoka, Y., Nishimoto, H., Masui, M., and Kainuma, M.: Global GHG
- 682 emissions scenarios under GHG concentration stabilization targets, Journal of
- 683 Environmental Engineering, 13, 97-108, 2008.
- Hoffert, M. I., Callegari, A. J., and Hsieh, C.-T.: The Role of Deep Sea Heat Storage in
- the Secular Response to Climatic Forcing, J. Geophys. Res., 85, 6667-6679,
- 686 10.1029/JC085iC11p06667, 1980.
- 687 Holland, M. M., and Bitz, C. M.: Polar amplification of climate change in coupled
- 688 models, Climate Dynamics, 21, 221-232, 10.1007/s00382-003-0332-6, 2003.
- Ince, D. C., Hatton, L., and Graham-Cumming, J.: The case for open computer programs,
 Nature, 482, 485-488, 2012.
- 691 IPCC: Climate Change 2001: The Science of Climate Change. Contribution of Working
- 692 Group I to the Second Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate
- 693 Change, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2001.
- 694 Irvine, P. J., Sriver, R. L., and Keller, K.: Tension between reducing sea-level rise and
- 695 global warming through solar-radiation management, Nature Clim. Change, 2, 97-100,

- 696 <u>http://www.nature.com/nclimate/journal/v2/n2/abs/nclimate1351.html#supplementary-</u>
- 697 <u>information</u>, 2012.
- Joos, F., Prentice, I. C., Sitch, S., Meyer, R., Hooss, G., Plattner, G.-K., Gerber, S., and
- 699 Hasselmann, K.: Global warming feedbacks on terrestrial carbon uptake under the
- 700 Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) Emission Scenarios, Global
- 701 Biogeochemical Cycles, 15, 891-907, 10.1029/2000GB001375, 2001a.
- Joos, F., Prentice, I. C., Sitch, S., Meyer, R., Hooss, G., Plattner, G.-K., Gerber, S., and
- 703 Hasselmann, K.: Global warming feedbacks on terrestrial carbon uptake under the
- Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) emission scenarios, Global
 Biochemical Cycles, 15, 891-907, 2001b.
- 706 Knox, F., and McElroy, M. B.: Changes in Atmospheric CO2: Influence of the Marine
- 707 Biota at High Latitude, J. Geophys. Res., 89, 4629-4637, 10.1029/JD089iD03p04629, 1984.
- 709 Knutti, R., and Hegerl, G. C.: The equilibrium sensitivity of the Earth's temperature to
- radiation changes, Nature Geosci, 1, 735-743, 2008.
- 711 Le Quéré, C., Andres, R. J., Boden, T., Conway, T., Houghton, R. A., House, J. I.,
- 712 Marland, G., Peters, G. P., van der Werf, G. R., Ahlström, A., Andrew, R. M., Bopp, L.,
- 713 Canadell, J. G., Ciais, P., Doney, S. C., Enright, C., Friedlingstein, P., Huntingford, C.,
- Jain, A. K., Jourdain, C., Kato, E., Keeling, R. F., Klein Goldewijk, K., Levis, S., Levy,
- 715 P., Lomas, M., Poulter, B., Raupach, M. R., Schwinger, J., Sitch, S., Stocker, B. D.,
- Viovy, N., Zaehle, S., and Zeng, N.: The global carbon budget 1959–2011, Earth Syst.
- 717 Sci. Data, 5, 165-185, 10.5194/essd-5-165-2013, 2013.
- Lenton, T. M.: Land and ocean carbon cycle feedback effects on global warming in a
- simple Earth system model, Tellus B, 52, 1159-1188, 10.1034/j.1600-0889.2000.01104.x,
 2000.
- Lenton, T. M., Myerscough, R. J., Marsh, R., Livina, V. N., Price, A. R., and Cox, S. J.:
- Using GENIE to study a tipping point in the climate system, 1890, 871-884 pp., 2009.
- 723 Manne, A. S., and Richels, R. G.: Merge: an integrated assessment model for global
- climate change, Energy and environment, edited by: Loulou, R., Waaub, J.-P., andZaccour, G., Springer, New York, 2005.
- Martin, R. C., Riehle, D., and Buschmann, F.: Pattern Languages of Program Design 3,
- Addison-Wesley, Boston, MA, 672 pp., 1997.
- 728 Meinshausen, M., Raper, S. C. B., and Wigley, T. M. L.: Emulating coupled atmosphere-
- 729 ocean and carbon cycle models with a simpler model, MAGICC6 Part 1: Model
- description and calibration, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 11, 1417-1456, 10.5194/acp-11-14172011, 2011a.
- 732 Meinshausen, M., Smith, S. J., Calvin, K., Daniel, J. S., Kainuma, M. L. T., Lamarque, J.
- F., Matsumoto, K., Montzka, S. A., Raper, S. C. B., Riahi, K., Thomson, A., Velders, G.
- J. M., and Vuuren, D. P. P.: The RCP greenhouse gas concentrations and their extensions
- 735 from 1765 to 2300, Climatic Change, 109, 213-241, 10.1007/s10584-011-0156-z, 2011b.
- 736 Meinshausen, M., Wigley, T. M. L., and Raper, S. C. B.: Emulating atmosphere-ocean
- and carbon cycle models with a simpler model, MAGICC6 Part 2: Applications,
- 738 Atmos. Chem. Phys., 11, 1457-1471, 10.5194/acp-11-1457-2011, 2011c.
- 739 Morice, C. P., Kennedy, J. J., Rayner, N. A., and Jones, P. D.: Quantifying uncertainties
- in global and regional temperature change using an ensemble of observational estimates:

- The HadCRUT4 data set, Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres, 117, D08101,
- 742 10.1029/2011JD017187, 2012.
- 743 Moss, R. H., Edmonds, J. A., Hibbard, K. A., Manning, M. R., Rose, S. K., van Vuuren,
- D. P., Carter, T. R., Emori, S., Kainuma, M., Kram, T., Meehl, G. A., Mitchell, J. F. B.,
- 745 Nakicenovic, N., Riahi, K., Smith, S. J., Stouffer, R. J., Thomson, A. M., Weyant, J. P.,
- and Wilbanks, T. J.: The next generation of scenarios for climate change research and
- 747 assessment, Nature, 463, 747-756,
- 748 <u>http://www.nature.com/nature/journal/v463/n7282/suppinfo/nature08823_S1.html</u>, 2010.
- 749 Murakami, K., Sasai, T., and Yamaguchi, Y.: A new one-dimensional simple energy
- balance and carbon cycle coupled model for global warming simulation, Theoretical and
 Applied Climatology, 101, 459-473, 10.1007/s00704-009-0232-8, 2010.
- 752 Myhre, G., Highwood, E. J., Shine, K. P., and Stordal, F.: New estimates of radiative
- forcing due to well mixed greenhouse gases, Geophysical Research Letters, 25, 2715-
- 754 2718, 10.1029/98GL01908, 1998.
- 755 Nemani, R. R., Keeling, C. D., Hashimoto, H., Jolly, W. M., Piper, S. C., Tucker, C. J.,
- 756 Myneni, R. B., and Running, S. W.: Climate-Driven Increases in Global Terrestrial Net
- 757 Primary Production from 1982 to 1999, Science, 300, 1560-1563,
- 758 10.1126/science.1082750, 2003.
- 759 Nordhaus, W. D.: A question of balance weighing the options on global warming
- 760 policies, Yale University Press, New Haven, 2008.
- 761 Piao, S., Sitch, S., Ciais, P., Friedlingstein, P., Peylin, P., Wang, X., Ahlström, A., Anav,
- A., Canadell, J. G., Cong, N., Huntingford, C., Jung, M., Levis, S., Levy, P. E., Li, J.,
- Lin, X., Lomas, M. R., Lu, M., Luo, Y., Ma, Y., Myneni, R. B., Poulter, B., Sun, Z.,
- 764 Wang, T., Viovy, N., Zaehle, S., and Zeng, N.: Evaluation of terrestrial carbon cycle
- models for their response to climate variability and to CO2 trends, Global Change
 Biology, 19, 2117-2132, 10.1111/gcb.12187, 2013.
- 767 Pietsch, S. A., and Hasenauer, H.: Evaluating the self-initialization procedure for large-
- scale ecosystem models, Global Change Biology, 12, 1-12, 10.1111/j.1365-
- 769 2486.2006.01211.x 2006.
- Raper, S. C., Gregory, J. M., and Stouffer, R. J.: The Role of Climate Sensititivity and
- Ocean Heat Uptake on AOGCM Transient Temperature Response, Journal of Climate,15, 124-130, 2002.
- 773 Raper, S. C. B., Gregory, J. M., and Osborn, T. J.: Use of an upwelling-diffusion energy
- balance climate model to simulate and diagnose A/OGCM results, Climate Dynamics, 17,601-613, 2001.
- Ratto, M., Castelletti, A., and Pagano, A.: Emulation techniques for the reduction and
- sensitivity analysis of complex environmental models, Environmental Modelling and
- 778 Software, 34, 1-4, 2012.
- 779 Riahi, K., Grubler, A., and Nakicenovic, N.: Scenarios of long-term socio-economic and
- environmental development under climate stabilization, Technological Forecasting andSocial Change, 74, 887-935, 2007.
- Ricciuto, D. M., Davis, K. J., and Keller, K.: A Bayesian calibration of a simple carbon
- 783 cycle model: The role of observations in estimating and reducing uncertainty, Global
- 784 Biogeochemical Cycles, 22, GB2030, 10.1029/2006GB002908, 2008.
- 785 Rogner, H. H.: An assessment of world hydrocarbon resources, Annual Review of
- 786 Energy and the Environment, 22, 217-262, 10.1146/annurev.energy.22.1.217, 1997.

- 787 Schlesinger, M. E., and Jiang, X.: Simple Model Representation of Atmosphere-Ocean
- 788 GCMs and Estimation of the Time Scale of C02-Induced Climate Change, Journal of
- 789 Climate, 3, 1297-1315, 10.1175/1520-0442(1990)003<1297:SMROAO>2.0.CO;2, 1990.
- 790 Senior, C. A., and Mitchell, J. F. B.: The time-dependence of climate sensitivity,
- 791 Geophysical Research Letters, 27, 2685-2688, 10.1029/2000GL011373, 2000.
- 792 Smith, S., and Wigley, T.: Multi-Gas Forcing Stabilization with the MiniCAM, Energy
- 793 Journal Special Issue #3, 373-391, 2006.
- Smith, S. J., and Bond, T. C.: Two hundred fifty years of aerosols and climate: the end of
- the age of aerosols, Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 13, 6419-6453, 10.5194/acp-14-5372014, 2014.
- 797 Sokolov, A. P., CA, S., S, D., S, P., DW, K., HD, J., RG, P., CE, F., JM, R., C, W., B, F.,
- MC, S., J, S., PH, S., M, J., and J, C.: The MIT Integrated Global System Model (IGSM)
- version 2: model description and baseline evaluation, MIT, Cambridge, 2005.
- 800 Sriver, R., Urban, N., Olson, R., and Keller, K.: Toward a physically plausible upper
- 801 bound of sea-level rise projections, Climatic Change, 115, 893-902, 10.1007/s10584-012802 0610-6, 2012.
- 803 Stocker, T.: Model Hierarchy and Simplified Climate Models, in: Introduction to Climate
- Modelling, Advances in Geophysical and Environmental Mechanics and Mathematics,
 Springer Berlin Heidelberg, 25-51, 2011.
- 806 Takahashi, T., Sutherland, S. C., Wanninkhof, R., Sweeney, C., Feely, R. A., Chipman,
- 807 D. W., Hales, B., Friederich, G., Chavez, F., Sabine, C., Watson, A., Bakker, D. C. E.,
- 808 Schuster, U., Metzl, N., Yoshikawa-Inoue, H., Ishii, M., Midorikawa, T., Nojiri, Y.,
- 809 Körtzinger, A., Steinhoff, T., Hoppema, M., Olafsson, J., Arnarson, T. S., Tilbrook, B.,
- Johannessen, T., Olsen, A., Bellerby, R., Wong, C. S., Delille, B., Bates, N. R., and de
- 811 Baar, H. J. W.: Climatological mean and decadal change in surface ocean pCO2, and net
- 812 sea-air CO2 flux over the global oceans, Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in
- 813 Oceanography, 56, 554-577, <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.dsr2.2008.12.009</u>, 2009.
- 814 Tanaka, K., Kriegler, E., Bruckner, T., Hooss, C., Knorr, W., and Raddatz, T.:
- 815 Aggregated Carbon Cycle, Atmospheric Chemistry, and Climate Model (ACC2) -
- 816 description of the forward and inverse models, Max Planck Institute for Meteorology.
- 817 Hamburg, Germany, 188, 2007a.
- 818 Tanaka, K., Kriegler, E., Bruckner, T., Hooss, G., Knorr, W., Raddatz, T. J., and Tol, R.:
- 819 Aggregated carbon cycle, atmospheric chemistry, and climate model (ACC2), Hamburg,
- 820 188, 2007b.
- Taylor, K. E., Stouffer, R. J., and Meehl, G. A.: An Overview of CMIP5 and the
- 822 Experiment Design, Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society, 93, 485-498,
- 823 10.1175/BAMS-D-11-00094.1, 2012.
- 824 Urban, N. M., and Keller, K.: Complementary observational constraints on climate
- 825 sensitivity, Geophysical Research Letters, 36, L04708, 10.1029/2008GL036457, 2009.
- 826 Urban, N. M., and Keller, K.: Probabilistic hindcasts and projections of the coupled
- 827 climate, carbon cycle and Atlantic meridional overturning circulation system: a Bayesian
- fusion of century-scale observations with a simple model, Tellus A, 62, 737-750,
- 829 10.1111/j.1600-0870.2010.00471.x, 2010.
- van Vuuren, D., Elzen, M. J., Lucas, P., Eickhout, B., Strengers, B., Ruijven, B., Wonink,
- 831 S., and Houdt, R.: Stabilizing greenhouse gas concentrations at low levels: an assessment

- of reduction strategies and costs, Climatic Change, 81, 119-159, 10.1007/s10584-006-
- 833 9172-9, 2007.
- van Vuuren, D., Lowe, J., Stehfest, E., Gohar, L., Hof, A., Hope, C., Warren, R.,
- 835 Meinshausen, M., and Plattner, G.-K.: How well do integrated assessment models
- simulate climate change?, Climatic Change, 104, 255-285, 10.1007/s10584-009-9764-2,
- 837 2011.
- 838 Ward, D. S., and Mahowald, N. M.: Contributions of developed and developing countries
- to global climate forcing and surface temperature change, Environmental ResearchLetters, 9, 074008, 2014.
- Wigley, T. M. L.: A simple inverse carbon cycle model, Global Biogeochemical Cycles,
 5, 373-382, 10.1029/91GB02279, 1991.
- 843 Wigley, T. M. L.: Global-mean temperature and sea level consequences of greenhouse
- gas concentration stabilization, Geophysical Research Letters, 22, 45-48,
- 845 10.1029/94GL01011, 1995.
- 846 Wigley, T. M. L., Richels, R., and Edmonds, J. A.: Economic and environmental choices 847 in the stabilization of atmospheric CO2 concentrations. Nature, 370, 240, 243, 1096
- in the stabilization of atmospheric CO2 concentrations, Nature, 379, 240-243, 1996.
- 848 Wigley, T. M. L., Smith, S. J., and Prather, M. J.: Radiative Forcing Due to Reactive Gas
- 849 Emissions, Journal of Climate, 15, 2690-2696, 10.1175/1520-
- 850 0442(2002)015<2690:RFDTRG>2.0.CO;2, 2002.
- 851 Wise, M., Calvin, K., Thomson, A., Clarke, L., Bond-Lamberty, B., Sands, R., Smith, S.
- J., Janetos, A., and Edmonds, J.: Implications of Limiting CO2 Concentrations for Land
- Use and Energy, Science, 324, 1183-1186, 10.1126/science.1168475, 2009.
- 854 Wolkovich, E. M., Regetz, J., and O'Connor, M. I.: Advances in global change research
- require open science by individual researchers, Global Change Biology, 18, 2102-2110,
 10.1111/j.1365-2486.2012.02693.x, 2012.
- 830 10.1111/J.1303-2480.2012.02095.X, 2012.
 857 Zooba D. E. and Walf Cladrow, D.: CO2 in Sequence
- Zeebe, R. E., and Wolf-Gladrow, D.: CO2 in Seawater: Equilibrium, Kinetics, Isotopes,
 Elsevier, 2001.
- 859
- 860
861 **Table and Figure Captions:**

- 862 **Table 1:** Initial model conditions prior to the spinup phase. Carbon values change
- 863 slightly after spinning up to a steady state.
- 864

Variable	Description	Initial Value	Units	Notes
*C _{atm}	Atmospheric Carbon	588.1	PgC	Murakami(2010)
*C _D	Detritus Carbon	55.0	PgC	Denman et al., (2007) Land carbon (detritus, soil and vegetation) totaling ~2300PgC
*Cs	Soil Carbon	1782.0	PgC	
*C _V	Vegetation Carbon	550.0	PgC	
C _{DO}	Deep Ocean	26000.0	PgC	Denman et al., (2007) Ocean carbon (deep, intermediate and surface) totaling ~3800PgC **
C _{HL}	Surface Ocean High Latitude	140.0	PgC	
C _{IO}	Intermediate Ocean	8400.0	PgC	
C _{LL}	Surface Ocean Low Latitude	770.0	PgC	
FL	Atmosphere-Land Carbon Flux	0.0	PgC yr ⁻¹	
Fo	Atmosphere-Ocean Carbon Flux	0.0	PgC yr ⁻¹	
NPP ₀	Net Primary Production	50.0	PgC yr ⁻¹	Approximate global value. Nemani et al., (2003)
T _G	Global Temperature Anomaly	0.0	°C	
T _{HL}	Temperature of high latitude surface ocean box	2.0	°C	Lenton, (2000)
T _{LL}	Temperature of low latitude surface ocean box	22.0	°C	Lenton, (2000)

865 * parameters appearing in the input file.

866 ** in order to obtain a steady state in Hector, carbon values in the intermediate box are

867 less than reported Denman et al.,(2007).

Table 2: Model parameters for the land and ocean carbon components.

Variable	Description	Value	Notes
f_{ds}	annual fraction of detritus carbon	0.60	The following
	that is transferred to soil		fractions (f) were
			selected to be
			generally consistent
			with previous simple earth system models
			(e.g., Meinshausen et
			al., 2011a; Ricciuto et
			al., 2008; Murakami et al., 2010).
*f _{ld}	annual fraction of land use change	0.01	
	flux from detritus		
f_{ls}	annual fraction of land use change	0.89	
	flux from soil		
*f _{/v}	annual fraction of land use change	0.10	
	flux from vegetation		
*f _{nd}	annual fraction of NPP carbon that is	0.60	
	transferred to detritus		
f_{ns}	annual fraction of NPP carbon that is	0.05	
	transferred to soil		
*f _{nv}	annual fraction of NPP carbon that is	0.35	
	transferred to vegetation		
$f_{ m rd}$	annual fraction of respiration carbon	0.25	
	that is transferred to detritus		
f_{rs}	annual fraction of respiration carbon	0.02	
	that is transferred to soil		
f_{vd}	annual fraction of vegetation carbon	0.034	
	that is transferred to detritus		
f_{vs}	annual fraction of vegetation carbon	0.001	
	that is transferred to soil		
*6	Beta	0.36	
*Q10	Q10 respiration	2.45	
*Т _Н	High-latitude circulation	4.9e7 m ³ s ⁻¹	Tuned to give ~100
			PgC from surface to
			deep
*T _⊺	Thermohaline circulation	7.2e7 m ³ s ⁻¹	Tuned to give ~100

			PgC from surface to
			deep
*E _{ID}	Water mass exchange – intermediate	1.25e7 m ³ s ⁻	Lenton, 2000; Knox
	todeep	1	and McElroy, 1984
*E _{LI}	Water mass exchange – low latitude	2.0e8 m ³ s ⁻¹	Lenton, 2000; Knox
	to intermediate		and McElroy, 1984

870

* parameters appearing in the input file.

871 **Table 3:** CMIP5 ESM models used within this study. We use the same suite of models as

- 872 found in Friedlingstein et al. (2014). Note, not all variables are reported for each model
- 873 under all scenarios.
- 874

Model	Model Name	Institute
bcc-csm1-1	Beijing Climate Center, Climate	Beijing Climate Center, China
	System Model, version 1.1	Meteorological Administration, China
CanESM2 *	Second Generation Canadian	Canadian Center for Climate Modeling
	Earth System Model	and Analysis, BC, Canada
CESM1-BGC *	Community Earth System	National Center for Atmospheric
	Model, version 1.0-	Research, United States
	Biogeochemistry	
GFDL-ESM2G	Geophysical Fluid Dynamic	Geophysical Fluid Dynamics Laboratory,
	Laboratory Earth System	United States
	Model with GOLD ocean	
	component	
HadGEM2-ES	Hadley Centre Global	Met Office Hadley Centre, United
	Environmental Model, version	Kingdom
	2 (Earth System)	
inmcm4	Institute of Numerical	Institute of Numerical Mathematics,
	Mathematics Coupled Model,	Russia
	version 4.0	
IPSL-CM5A-LR	L'Institut Pierre-Simon Laplace	Institut Pierre Simon Laplace, France
	Coupled Model, version 5A,	
	coupled with NEMO, low	
	resolution	
MIROC-ESM *	Model for Interdisciplinary	Atmosphere and Ocean Research
	Research on Climate, Earth	Institute; National Institute for
	System Model	Environmental Studies, Japan Agency for
		Marine-Earth Science and Technology,
		Japan
MPI-ESM-LR	Max Planck Institute Earth	Max Planck Institute for Meteorology,
	System Model, low resolution	Germany
MRI-ESM1 *	Meteorological Research	Meteorological Research Institute Earth,
	Institute Earth System Model,	Japan
	version 1	
NorESM1-ME *	Norwegian Earth System	Norwegian Climate Center, Norway
	Model, version 1, intermediate	

resolution

* Models used in emissions forced scenarios (esmhist and esmrcp85).

875 **Table 4:** Root mean square error (RMSE) for Hector versus observations, CMIP5, and

876 MAGICC for atmospheric [CO2], surface temperature anomaly, radiative forcing, fluxes

solution of carbon (ocean and land), and low latitude surface ocean pH and change (Δ) in

878 atmospheric [CO2], surface temperature anomaly and radiative forcing for Hector,

879 CMIP5, observations, and MAGICC6.

Historical 1850 - 2005						
Variable		Hector	Observations	MAGICC	CMIP5	Units
[CO ₂]*	RMSE		2.85	2.95	2.21	ppmv
	Δ	85.78	94.47	95.0	103.30	
temperature	RMSE		0.15	0.13	0.15	deg C
	Δ	0.98	0.91	0.76	1.01	
Forcing	RMSE			0.39		W m⁻²
	Δ	2.16		1.75		
Ocean Flux	RMSE				0.25	PgC yr⁻¹
Land Flux	RMSE				1.27	PgC yr⁻¹
рН	RMSE				0.004	unitless

*[CO₂] observations are an average of Law Dome and Mauna Loa.

RCP 8.5 1850 - 2300

		1101 0.5 1050	2500		
Variable		Hector	MAGICC	CMIP5	Units
[CO ₂] *	RMSE		10.41	7.54	ppmv
	Δ	1557.91	1695.0		
temperature	RMSE		0.12	0.52	deg C
	Δ	9.58	8.05	10.57	
Forcing	RMSE		0.26		W m ⁻²
	Δ	12.80	12.24		
Ocean Flux	RMSE			1.39	PgC yr⁻¹
Land Flux	RMSE			3.86	PgC yr⁻¹ PgC yr⁻¹
рН	RMSE			0.003	unitless

*CMIP5 [CO₂] only to 2100.

		RCP 6.5 2005 - 2	500		
Variable		Hector	MAGICC	CMIP5	Units
[CO ₂]*	RMSE		10.07	7.23	ppmv
	Δ	1472.13	1600.0		
temperature	RMSE		0.09	0.58	deg C
	Δ	8.59	7.30	9.57	
Forcing	RMSE		0.03		W m ⁻²
	Δ	10.65	10.49		
Ocean Flux	RMSE			1.41	PgC yr⁻¹
Land Flux	RMSE			4.59	PgC yr ⁻¹ PgC yr ⁻¹
рН	RMSE			0.001	unitless

RCP 8.5 2005 - 2300

*CMIP5 [CO₂] only to 2100.

881

882

Figure 1: Model phases for the coupler (left) and a typical component (right). Arrowsshow flow of control and data. The greyed spinup step is optional.



888 Figure 2: Representation of Hector's carbon cycle, land, atmosphere, and ocean. The 889 atmosphere consists of one well mixed box. The ocean consists of four boxes, with 890 advection and water mass exchange simulating thermohaline circulation (see Table 2 for 891 description of parameters). At steady state, the high latitude surface ocean takes up 892 carbon from the atmosphere, while the low latitude surface ocean off gases carbon to 893 the atmosphere. The land consists of a user defined number of biomes or regions for 894 vegetation, detritus and soil. At steady state the vegetation takes up carbon from the 895 atmosphere while the detritus and soil release carbon back into the atmosphere. The 896 earth pool is continually debited with each time step to act as a mass balance check on





Figure 3: Historical atmospheric [CO₂] from 1850 to 2005 for Hector (blue), CMIP5
median, standard deviation, and model range (pink, n=4), MAGICC6 (green), Law Dome
(teal), and Mauna Loa (brown). Note CMIP5 data are from the prescribed emissions
historical scenario (esmHistorical). MAGICC6, however, is constrained to match the
observational record. Although Hector can be run with similar constraints, in this study
Hector was unconstrained to highlight the full performance of the model. n=4 is the
number of CMIP5 models used to produce this figure.



- 911 **Figure 4**: Historical global temperature anomaly relative to 1850 for Hector (blue),
- 912 MAGICC6 (green), CMIP5 median, standard deviation and model range (pink, n=8), and
- 913 historical observations from HadCRUT4 (purple). Hector is running without the effects of
- 914 volcanic forcing, leading to a smoother representation of temperature with time.
- 915



- 917 Figure 5: Atmospheric [CO₂] from 1850 to 2100 under RCP 8.5 for Hector (blue),
- 918 MAGICC6 (green), Mauna Loa (brown), Law Dome (teal) and esmRCP 8.5 (prescribed
- 919 emissions scenario) CMIP5 median, one standard deviation and model range (pink, n=4
- 920 (1850-2000) and n=5 (2001-2100)). Note that the CMIP5 models run under esmrcp85



921 do not extend to 2300.

Figure 6: Atmospheric [CO₂] from 1850 to 2300 for RCP 2.6 (red), RCP 4.5 (green), RCP

6.0 (blue), RCP 8.5 (purple), Hector (solid) and MAGICC6 (dashed).



- 929 **Figure 7:** Relative radiative forcing from 1850 to 2300 for Hector (solid) and MAGICC6
- 930 (dashed) for all four RCP scenarios, 2.6 (red), 4.5 (green), 6.0 (blue), 8.5 (purple). Hector
- 931 has the option to enable or disable radiative forcing from historical volcanic emissions.
- 932 We have opted to disable this for ease of comparison across all RCPs.
- 933



Figure 8: Global temperature anomaly relative to 1850 for (a) RCP 2.6 (b) RCP 4.5 (c) RCP
6.0 and (d) RCP 8.5, comparing Hector (blue), MAGICC6 (green), and CMIP5 median,
standard deviation and model range (pink). The CMIP5 models under RCP 6.0 used in
this study do not extend to 2300. Note the change in scales between the four panels.

this study do not extend to 2300. Note the change in scales between the four panels.
Number of CMIP5 models in a) n=7 (2006-2100) and n=5 (2101-2300), b) n=9 (2006-

- 2100) and n=6(2101-2300), c) n=6 (2006-2100), d) n=9 (2006-2100) and n=3 (2101-
- 942 2300).



- 945 Figure 9: Global air-sea fluxes of carbon under RCP 8.5, Hector (blue), MAGICC5.3
- 946 (purple, note that this is not the current version of MAGICC), CMIP5 median, standard
- 947 deviation, and model range (pink, n=9 (1850-2100) and n=4 (2101-2300)), and
- 948 observations from GCP (green) (Le Quéré et al., 2013). The break in the graph at 2100
- 949 signifies a change in the number of models that ran the RCP 8.5 extension.



950 951

- 952 Figure 10: Global air-land fluxes of carbon under RCP 8.5, Hector (blue), CMIP5 median,
- 953 standard deviation, and model range (pink, n=8 (1850-2100) and n=2 (2101-2300)), and
- 954 observations from GCP (green) (Le Quéré et al., 2013). The break in the graph at 2100
- 955 signifies a change in the number of models that ran the RCP 8.5 extension.
- 956



958 **Figure 11:** Low latitude (< 55) ocean pH for RCP 8.5, from 1850 – 2100, Hector (blue),

959 CMIP5 median, standard deviation, and model range (pink, n=6) and observations from

960 BATS (green) and HOTS (purple).



