

Interactive comment on “ADISM v.1.0: an adjoint of a thermomechanical ice-sheet model obtained using an algorithmic differentiation tool” by J. McGovern et al.

P. Huybrechts (Editor)

phuybrec@vub.ac.be

Received and published: 23 February 2014

Based on the referee comments and my own evaluation of the manuscript and the accompanying material I believe this paper should not be published in GMD. The main reasons for rejecting this manuscript are a lack of substance and scientific rigour, which weaknesses have not been convincingly addressed by the proposed revisions in the author replies.

The referees have rightly pointed out that the ice-sheet model description and its application to the EISMINT2 tests offers nothing new and is an unnecessary repetition of material found at length elsewhere. Similarly, the OpenAD tool is not presented in

C2648

a way to appeal to potential readers of the paper. Original insights in the application of these tools making a substantial contribution to the community and to glaciologists interested in further developments are indeed thinly sown.

The manuscript should remain in the discussions section where it will be fully citable as a technical note.

Interactive comment on Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., 6, 5251, 2013.